

Summary of Compliance with Comprehensive Plan

1. Consistency with Generalized Policy Map (“GPM”)

As shown on the GPM, the majority of the Project Site is located within an area spanning both sides of Massachusetts Avenue, NW that is designated as a “Neighborhood Commercial Center,” which is one of five commercial/mixed use areas on the GPM that collectively define the physical and economic character of areas and their generalized long-range conservation and development objectives (10-A DCMR § 223.13).

The Neighborhood Commercial Center designation is described in the Framework Element as an area that meets the day-to-day needs of residents and workers in adjacent neighborhoods with a service area of approximately one mile. Typical uses within a Neighborhood Commercial Center include, among others, convenience stores, supermarkets, branch banks, restaurants, basic services, and office space for small businesses (10-A DCMR § 223.15). Unlike the “Main Street Retail Corridors” category, a Neighborhood Commercial Center includes both auto-oriented centers and pedestrian-oriented shopping areas. According to the Framework Element, new development and redevelopment within Neighborhood Commercial Areas must be managed to conserve the economic viability of these areas while allowing additional development that complements existing uses (10-A DCMR § 223.16).

The Project is not inconsistent with the Neighborhood Commercial Center designation because it will provide a new mixed-use development that includes a new full-service grocery store and additional retail that will make it easier for existing and new residents and workers to meet their day-to-day needs, is designed in a context-sensitive manner, and effectively manages and mitigates vehicle trips.

The Project will also complement and expand upon nearby neighborhood-serving commercial uses, and contribute to the economic viability of commercial uses on both sides of Massachusetts Avenue by adding additional residential use within close proximity. Not only will the Project provide additional housing opportunities, but it will do so by providing many larger-sized dwelling units. Specifically, approximately 53% of the proposed dwelling units within the Project will be devoted to larger-sized units (two-bedroom, two-bedroom plus den, and three-bedroom) and approximately 69% of the affordable dwelling units provided in the Project will have two or more bedrooms. These new larger-sized dwelling units will increase housing for younger families striving to establish themselves in the Upper Northwest quadrant of Washington, DC, and provide opportunities for long-time residents that wish to downsize while remaining in their neighborhood and close to amenities.

In addition to the foregoing, a portion of Lot 806 on which the AU Building is located is identified as Institutional on the GMP, which designation includes land and facilities occupied and used by colleges and universities, among other similar institutions. The Applicant does not propose any modifications to the AU Building or Lot 806, and thus its current university use will remain consistent with the Institutional designation on the GPM.

2. Consistency with Future Land Use Map (“FLUM”)

The FLUM depicts future land uses across the District and is intended to represent the land use policies set forth in the Comprehensive Plan Land Use Element. It is well established, and is specifically stated in the Framework Element under the “Guidelines for Using the Generalized Policy Map and the Future Land Use Map” (“Guidelines”) that the FLUM is not a zoning map, and does not specify allowable uses or dimensional standards. By definition, the FLUM is to be interpreted broadly (10-A DCMR 226(a)). Further, the densities within any given area on the FLUM are intended to reflect all contiguous properties on a block, there may be individual buildings that are higher or lower than these ranges within each area, and the land use categories describe the general character of development in each area (10-A DCMR § 226(c)). As expressly stated in the Framework Element, because of the scale of the FLUM many of the areas shown purely as “Commercial” on the FLUM may also contain other uses, including housing (10-A DCMR § 225.20).

The FLUM designates the Project Site as Low Density Commercial. Areas that have the low-density commercial designation can range from small business districts that draw primarily from the surrounding neighborhoods to larger business districts that draw from a broader market area, and are commonly comprised of one- to three-story commercial buildings. According to the description of the Low Density Commercial land use designation, which predates the 2016 Zoning Regulations (“ZR16”) and thus includes references to zone district classifications from the 1958 Zoning Regulations (“ZR58”), the zone districts that typically correspond to the Low Density Commercial land use designation include C-1 and C-2-A, although other districts may apply (10-A DCMR 225.4).

In September, 2016, the provisions of ZR58 were repealed and replaced with the provisions of ZR16. As a result, the zone classification of the Project Site was renamed from C-2-A to MU-4. Despite the change in name, no changes were made to the primary development standards that controlled matter-of-right development on the Project Site. Thus, by definition the Project Site’s existing MU-4 zoning is not inconsistent with the FLUM. Indeed, the MU-4 zone, which is described under Subtitle G of ZR16 as being appropriate in “low- and moderate-density residential areas with access to main roadways or rapid transit stops, and include office employment centers, shopping centers, and moderate bulk mixed-use centers,” is commonly found throughout the District in areas that are designated as Low Density Commercial on the FLUM and have similar surrounding contexts as the Project Site. Further, the Commission has previously found the C-2-A zone to be not inconsistent with the Low Density Commercial land use designation of the Comprehensive Plan FLUM.¹

The Project is not inconsistent with the portion of the Low Density Commercial description that describes a common feature of these areas being “comprised primarily of one- to three-story commercial buildings.” First, the Applicant notes that it is not proposing to construct any buildings that are solely devoted to commercial use on the Project Site, but rather is proposing a mixed-use project containing residential and retail uses, both of which are expressly stated as being appropriate within areas designated as commercial on the FLUM (10-A DCMR 225.20). This interpretation is consistent with the plain meaning of the Comprehensive Plan, as drafted. The

¹ See, e.g. Z.C. Order No. 08-15 and Z.C. Order No. 12-16.

language of the Comprehensive Plan is unambiguous, and expressly qualifies the language regarding the number of stories in Low Density Commercial areas as relating to *commercial* buildings.

Second, as the Guidelines state, the densities within any given area on the FLUM reflect all contiguous properties on a block, and that individual buildings may be higher or lower than the ranges within each area. Thus when viewed within the context of the Guidelines, it is apparent that the buildings proposed on Lot 807 (the “Valor Lot”) are not inconsistent with the FLUM as they will sit within a block (Square 1499) that is currently comprised of commercial buildings that range in height and density from one- to two-stories (Massachusetts Avenue Parking Shops (“MAPS”), PNC Bank, Spring Valley Exxon) to six stories (AU Building).

3. Consistency with Comprehensive Plan Guiding Principles

The Project is not inconsistent with the guiding principles of the Comprehensive Plan that aim to manage growth and change, create successful neighborhoods, connect the city, and build green and healthy communities.

a. Managing Growth

The Project is consistent with principles related to overcoming physical, social, and economic obstacles to ensure that the benefits and opportunities available to District residents are equitably distributed. Specifically, the Project will expand the range of housing types within Upper Northwest by providing an array of dwelling units that can accommodate households of different sizes, with the majority (approximately 53%) consisting of larger-sized (two-bedroom, two-bedroom plus den, and three-bedroom) units that can accommodate a diverse range of residents including, among others, young professionals, new families, and longtime residents that may wish to downsize while remaining in the neighborhood and close to amenities. In addition, the Project will substantially advance the District’s affordable housing goals within an area of the city where opportunities to provide affordable housing are few, and the inventory of affordable dwellings units is severely lacking.

The Project also exhibits many of the characteristics that are typical of a successful infill project. The Project Site is in a walkable and bike-friendly neighborhood, is less than one mile from the Tenleytown Metrorail station, and is in close proximity to the N4 and N6 Metrobus routes that operate along Massachusetts Avenue and provide service to nearby Metrorail stations and downtown Washington. The Project Site is also within close proximity to public and private schools, American University, and several parks and neighborhood-serving amenities that will allow residents to fulfill most daily errands on foot.

b. Creating Successful Neighborhoods

The Project is consistent with principles related to creating successful neighborhoods.. First, the Project will improve the character of the neighborhood by replacing the vacant grocery store building and expansive surface parking lot with a new mixed-use development containing residential and retail uses that is designed in a context-sensitive manner, and is compatible with

the height, scale, massing, materials, and architectural styles of the surroundings. The Project will also help protect the historic MAPS from future additional development by significantly reducing the amount of unused density on the MAPS site. Finally, the Project furthers principles related to the need for growing an inclusive city and addressing ongoing challenges to housing affordability through the construction of approximately 219 new housing units, including approximately 29 new affordable dwelling units, within a high-opportunity neighborhood located west of Rock Creek Park.

c. Connecting the City

The Project is consistent with the guiding principles pertaining to connecting the city. As referenced above, the Project is located in a walkable, bike-friendly, and transit accessible location, which residents will be able to take advantage of to get to where they need. In order for residents to take full advantage of this wide range of travel options, the streets, sidewalks, and alleys around the Project Site must be constructed, improved, and maintained to a satisfactory condition. The Project includes several streetscape improvements that will improve mobility and circulation around the Project Site and the overall neighborhood, including the elimination of two large curb cuts and improvements to circulation along the public and private alleys serving the Project Site. In addition, the Applicant has committed to constructing several pedestrian improvements at nearby intersections as part of the Project's transportation demand management plan and additional requests from DDOT.

d. Building Green and Healthy Communities

The Project is fully consistent with the Comprehensive Plan's guiding principles pertaining to building green and healthy communities. Currently, the Valor Lot is improved with a vacant grocery store building and vast surface parking lot, both of which are completely impervious and lack any form of sustainable storm water management. The Project will replace this environmentally insensitive condition with a number of new landscaped areas, shade trees, and green roof areas that will provide numerous environmental benefits. The Project has been designed to integrate a host of sustainable features and will achieve LEED Gold v.4 certification

4. Consistency with Citywide Elements

a. Land Use Element

The Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan establishes the basic policies guiding the physical form of the city and provides direction on a range of development, conservation, and land use compatibility issues. The goal of the Land Use Element is to “[e]nsure the efficient use of land resources to meet long-term neighborhood, citywide, and regional needs; to help foster other District goals; to protect the health, safety, and welfare of District residents and businesses; to sustain, restore or improve the character and stability of neighborhoods in all parts of the city; and to effectively balance the competing demands for land to support the many activities that take place within District boundaries.”

The Project is not inconsistent with those policies of the Land Use Element that are applicable to the proposed development, including:

- **LU-1.4.1: Infill Development** –The Project will be an infill development and will be carried out in a manner that complements the established character of the surroundings and provides an appropriate transition between the lower-scale residential neighborhood to the north and east and the larger-scale AU Building. Over the past several years the Applicant has had extensive engagement with the community, which has resulted in substantial reductions and refinements to the proposed design. For example, the Applicant reduced the height of Building 1 to approximately 43.5 feet (6.5 feet below the maximum permitted matter-of-right height of 50 feet and 21.5 feet below the maximum permitted height as a PUD). The reduction in height, upper-level setbacks, façade articulation, and high-quality design, will mitigate any potential for adverse impacts to adjacent buildings and ensure that Building 1 successfully responds to the immediate surroundings, especially along 48th and Yuma Streets, and will provide an appropriate backdrop to the historic MAPS.
 - To further respond to community comments, the Project includes five low-scale townhomes that are approximately 37 feet in height. Four of the townhomes will have a 10-foot tall penthouse that is set back as required and provides access to a modest-sized roof deck that is oriented toward the rear of the townhomes, away from the residences across 48th Street. The smaller scale and compatible architectural design of the townhomes will mitigate the potential impacts of the Project by breaking down the scale and massing of the Project along 48th Street, especially in relation to the existing residences to the east, and add variety along the streetscape
 - **LU-1.4.2: Long-Term Vacant Sites** – This policy promotes facilitating “the reuse of vacant lots that have historically been difficult to develop due to infrastructure or access problems, inadequate lot dimensions, fragmented or absentee ownership, or other constraints” (emphasis added). Consistent with this policy, the Project will redevelop the long vacant and underutilized Valor Lot with a new mixed-used development that contains a new full-service grocery store that is desired by the community, but cannot be provided under a matter-of-right development due to constraints resulting from the Allocation Agreement and changes to zoning over time. However, these constraint can be overcome through the PUD process, which expressly permits the aggregation of density across the Project Site. Doing so will allow the Applicant to utilize unused gross floor area from the MAPS to provide the highly-desired grocery store and much needed new housing and affordable housing.
- LU-2.1.3: Conserving, Enhancing, and Revitalizing Neighborhoods** – This policy promotes increasing housing supply and expanding neighborhood commerce in all parts of the city while at the same time protecting neighborhood character, preserving historic resources, and restoring the environment. The Project will redevelop the underutilized Valor Lot with a new full-service grocery store, potential additional retail, and expanded housing opportunities, including providing a substantial amount of affordable housing in an area of the District where the inventory of existing affordable housing is significantly less than the rest of the city and opportunities to construct new affordable housing are few. In addition, the Project will help protect the historic MAPS from future development, and help restore the environment by replacing the substantially impervious condition that exists on the Valor Lot with a sustainably designed project that will be certified at the LEED Gold level.

- **LU-2.1.5: Conservation of Single Family Neighborhoods** – This policy promotes the protection and conservation of the District’s low density neighborhoods through ensuring that zoning reflects their low density character, and managing the development of structures in and adjacent to single family neighborhoods in order to protect low density character, preserve open space, and maintain neighborhood scale. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy. First, the height of the buildings proposed on Lot 807 are all below the maximum permitted matter-of-right height in the MU-4 zone. In addition, to mitigate any potential impacts on the adjacent neighborhood, the buildings have been carefully designed and extensively refined in response to community input to ensure that they relate to the scale of the surrounding single-family neighborhood through lower building heights, large upper-level setbacks, reductions in mass using courtyards and terraces, compatible materials, and architectural style. The proposed design, together with the substantial separation provided by Yuma and 48th Streets (both 90 foot wide rights-of-way) successfully integrate the Project into the surrounding context in a manner that protects the low density character of the neighborhood to the north and east while also establishing an appropriate transition to the larger-scale AU Building and commercial center to the south.
- **LU-2.2.4: Neighborhood Beautification** – This policy encourages projects that improve the visual quality of the District’s neighborhoods through landscaping, improvement or removal of abandoned buildings, and street and sidewalk repair, among others. The Project will significantly improve the visual quality of the Valor Lot, and thus the neighborhood, by replacing an unsightly and underutilized vacant grocery store and expansive surface parking lot with a new mixed-use development that has been designed to relate to the surrounding context, include several landscape improvements, and construct substantial improvements to surrounding public space.
- **LU-2.3.3: Buffering Requirements** – This policy strives to ensure that new commercial development adjacent to lower-density residential areas provides effective physical buffers, including setbacks, landscaping, height step downs, and other architectural and site planning measures to be compatible with the surrounding context. While the Project is primarily a residential development, to effectively mitigate potential impacts the Applicant has successfully incorporated each of the buffering measures stated above. As shown in the street sections included in the Plans, the distance at ground level between the Project and the residences along 48th and Yuma Streets ranges between 90 and 137 feet, with further buffering provided by large landscaped courtyards and substantial upper-level setbacks.
- **LU-2.4.1: Promotion of Commercial Centers** – This policy promotes the vitality of the District’s commercial centers to meet the needs of District residents and expand employment opportunities for District residents. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy as it will reestablish a full-service grocery store use, which is a use that has a long history on the Valor Lot and is highly desired by the community, especially considering the closures of the Tenleytown and Palisades Safeway stores. The open spaces and plazas that have been integrated into the Project’s design will provide inviting and attractive places for residents and neighbors to enjoy. In addition, the Project has been designed to provide convenient vehicular access, which will minimize impacts to neighborhood streets.

- **LU-2.4.2: Hierarchy of Commercial Centers** – This policy promotes maintaining and reinforcing the District’s hierarchy of neighborhood, multi-neighborhood, regional, and main street commercial centers. The Project reinforces the GPM “Neighborhood Commercial Center” designation of the Project Site by providing a new full service grocery store, a common use in a Neighborhood Commercial Area, and which will complement and expand upon nearby neighborhood-serving commercial offerings. The Project will also complement existing uses and contribute to the economic viability of nearby commercial uses on both sides of Massachusetts Avenue by adding several new residential units within close proximity.
- **LU-2.4.5: Encouraging Nodal Development** – This policy is focused on promoting pedestrian-oriented “nodes” of development at key locations along major corridors and ensuring that such development is consistent with applicable zoning and design standards and respects the integrity and character of surrounding residential areas. The Project Site is identified as part of a Neighborhood Commercial Center on the GPM, and the Project will complement and expand upon the range of neighborhood-serving retail and service uses that exist within the commercial node on both sides of the Massachusetts Avenue corridor. The Project will also improve pedestrian circulation through and around the Project Site. Furthermore, the Project fully complies with matter-of-right and PUD height, density, and lot occupancy standards under the existing MU-4 zoning. Finally, the height, mass, and scale of the Project, especially along 48th and Yuma Streets, have been carefully designed and constrained to relate to the residential neighborhood to the north and east through building height step-downs, large upper-level setbacks, reductions in mass using courtyards and terraces, compatible materials, and architectural style. The outcome of these design gestures is a Project that respects the surrounding neighborhood and effectively mitigates potential impacts.
- **LU-2.4.6: Scale and Design of New Commercial Uses** – This policy is focused on ensuring that new uses within commercial districts are developed at a height, mass, scale, and design that is appropriate and compatible with surrounding areas. The proposed Project design is not inconsistent with this policy. The building height step-downs, upper-level setbacks, and façade articulation for Building 1 successfully respond to the immediate surroundings, especially along 48th and Yuma Streets, and will provide an appropriate backdrop to the historic MAPS. In addition, the smaller scale and compatible architectural design of the townhomes will break down the scale and massing of the Project along 48th Street. Further, the townhomes, as well as the proposal for Windom Park, will establish a pedestrian scale and add architectural variety along the 48th Street. Not only will the Project’s scale and massing be compatible with the surrounding area, it will also establish an appropriate transition between the lower-scale residential area to the north and east and the commercial center and larger-scale AU Building to the south and west.

b. Housing Element

The overarching goal of the Housing Element is to “[d]evelop and maintain a safe, decent, and affordable supply of housing for all current and future residents of the District of Columbia.” The Project will help achieve this goal by advancing the policies discussed below. Overall, the Project is not inconsistent with the policies of the Housing Element that are applicable to the proposed development, including the following:

- **H-1.1.1: Private Sector Support** – This policy encourages the private sector to provide new housing to meet the needs of present and future District residents at locations that are consistent with District land use policies and objectives. As discussed above, the Project Site is in an area where new residential and neighborhood-serving retail and service uses are encouraged. Consistent with the Project Site’s GPM designation as a Neighborhood Commercial Center, the approximately 219 new dwelling units included in the Project will complement existing uses in the surrounding area and contribute to the economic viability of nearby commercial uses on both sides of Massachusetts Avenue. The Project provides new market-rate and affordable housing opportunities, including several larger-sized dwelling units that will be available to younger families and longtime residents.
- **H-1.1.3: Balanced Growth** – This policy encourages development of new housing on surplus, vacant, and underutilized land in all parts of the city. As discussed above, the Project will provide approximately 219 new residential dwelling units, including a substantial number of affordable units, on a site that is significantly underutilized given its existing zoning, GPM designation, size, walkability, and proximity to several neighborhood-serving retail and service uses, parks, community and medical facilities, and high-quality schools.
- **H-1.1.4: Mixed Use Development** – This policy promotes mixed-use development, including housing, on commercially zoned land, and particularly in neighborhood commercial centers and other areas. As discussed above, the Project Site is designated as a Neighborhood Commercial Center on the GPM, and the Project includes mixed-use development consisting of a new grocery store, additional retail space, and residential uses.
- **H-1.2.3: Mixed Income Housing** – The focus of this policy is to facilitate the distribution of mixed income housing more equitably across the entire city. Opportunities to provide affordable housing in the Upper Northwest quadrant of the District are few, and the inventory of affordable dwellings units in Ward 3 is severely lacking. The Project will increase the inventory of affordable housing in a high-opportunity neighborhood that is safe, walkable, and close to neighborhood-serving amenities, parks, community and medical facilities, and schools.
- **H-1.3.1: Housing for Families** – This policy encourages the production of a greater number of larger-sized dwelling units that can accommodate families. As currently designed the overall Project will contain approximately 81 two-bedroom and two-bedroom plus den units (approximately 37% of the total units), and approximately 36 three-bedroom units (approximately 16.4% of the total units). Thus, approximately 53.4% of all proposed units and approximately 69% of all proposed affordable units will be devoted to larger-sized units that will be able to accommodate families.
- **H-4.2.2: Housing Choice for Seniors** – The Housing Element recognizes the need for providing a wide variety of housing choices for seniors, including in those neighborhoods characterized by large numbers of seniors living alone in single family homes. The Project supports a neighborhood-based approach to senior housing by providing new housing opportunities to seniors, and even non-senior empty-nesters, that will reduce home maintenance costs and obligations for populations that may either be burdened by the

continued escalation of property values and/or wish to downsize while remaining close to neighborhood amenities.

c. Environmental Protection Element

The Environmental Protection Element addresses the protection, restoration, and management of the District's land, air, water, energy, and biological resources. The element provides policies and actions on important issues such as restoring the city's tree canopy, energy conservation, and air quality. As discussed above, the Project will substantially improve the environmental quality of the Project Site by redeveloping the Valor Lot, which is almost entirely impervious and lacks any kind of sustainable storm water management, with a sustainably designed mixed-use development. Overall, the Project is not inconsistent with the policies of the Environmental Protection Element that are applicable to the proposed development, including the following:

- **E-3.1.2: Using Landscaping and Green Roofs to Reduce Runoff** – This policy promotes increases in tree planting and landscaping to reduce storm water runoff, including the expanded use of green roofs in new construction. The Valor Lot is currently improved with a vacant grocery store building and vast surface parking lot, both of which are completely impervious and lack any form of sustainable storm water management. The Project will replace this environmentally insensitive condition with a number of new landscaped areas, shade trees, and green roof areas that will provide numerous environmental benefits, including reductions in storm water runoff and urban heat island effect. The Applicant will also reconstruct the public space along Yuma and 48th Streets, including the permanent closure of approximately 80 linear feet of existing curb cuts, thereby providing space for additional street trees.
- **E-3.2.1: Support for Green Building** – This policy encourages the use of green building methods in new construction and rehabilitation projects. As shown on the LEED scorecard included in the Plans, the Project will be LEED Gold certified.

d. Economic Development Element

The Economic Development Element addresses the future of the District's economy, the creation of economic opportunity for current and future residents, the revitalization of neighborhood commercial centers. As demonstrated below, the Project is not inconsistent with the objectives and policies of the Economic Element.

- **ED-2.2.3: Neighborhood Shopping** – This policy promotes the creation of additional shopping opportunities in Washington's neighborhood commercial districts to better meet the demand for basic goods and services. The Project will advance this policy through the construction of a new full-service grocery store that has been effectively integrated into the proposed development. A grocery store use has long existed on the Valor Lot until the most recent operation closed in late-2013, and continues to be a desired use by the community, especially since the closure of the nearby Tenleytown and Palisades Safeway stores.

- **ED-2.2.6: Grocery Stores and Supermarkets** – This policy promotes the development of new grocery stores and supermarkets, particularly in neighborhoods where residents currently travel long distances for food and other shopping services. As part of the Project, the Applicant will construct a new full-service grocery store, a use that existed on the Valor Lot for many years and continues to be desired by the community.
- **ED-3.1.1: Neighborhood Commercial Vitality** – This policy promotes the vitality and diversity of neighborhood commercial areas by retaining existing businesses, attracting new businesses, and improving the mix of goods and services available to residents. The Project will advance this policy by establishing a new neighborhood-serving grocery store that will increase the mix of goods and services available to residents and complement and expand upon other nearby neighborhood-serving commercial offerings located along Massachusetts Avenue.

e. **Urban Design Element**

The goal of the Comprehensive Plan’s Urban Design Element is to “[e]nhance the beauty and livability of the city by protecting its historic design legacy, reinforcing the identity of its neighborhoods, harmoniously integrating new construction with existing buildings and the natural environment, and improving the vitality, appearance, and security of streets and public spaces.” The Project will greatly assist in achieving this Comprehensive Plan goal. The Urban Design Element specifically promotes thoughtful infill development that avoids overpowering contrasts in scale, height, and density. In addition, this Element stipulates that commercial and mixed-use development should be harmonious with its surroundings, but not necessarily duplicate adjacent buildings. Rather, it states that new construction should “respect the basic block characteristics like building alignment, access, proportion of openings, exterior architectural details, and heights.”

In order to mitigate potential impacts on the surrounding neighborhood, the Applicant has taken great care to ensure compatibility with the surrounding residential neighborhood. The height, mass, architectural design, and access to the Project have all been informed by the context that exists around the Project Site and by extensive engagement with the community. As shown in the Plans, the design of the Project respects the basic block characteristics of the surrounding context. For example, the height of the townhomes and heights and proportions of Building 1 relate to the heights of the residences along 48th and Yuma Streets. As a result, the Project will provide an appropriate transition between the residential area to the north and east, and the AU Building and other commercial uses to the south and west. In addition, the Project’s exterior details and materials have been informed by the surrounding neighborhood, while also having its own identity, such that the Project will contribute positively to the established architectural character. Overall, the Project is not inconsistent with the Urban Design Element, including the following policies:

- **UD-2.2.1: Neighborhood Character and Identity** – This policy promotes strengthening the defining visual qualities of Washington’s neighborhoods “in part by relating the scale of infill development... to existing neighborhood context.” The Project successfully advances this policy by replacing an unsightly and underutilized vacant grocery store and expansive surface parking lot with a new mixed-use development that has been designed to relate to the surrounding context through the use of building height step downs, substantial upper-level

setbacks, reductions in massing through the use of courtyards and terraces, compatible materials, and architectural style.

- **UD-2.2.4: Transitions in Building Intensity** – In designing the Project, the Applicant has given substantial consideration to this particular policy given the context surrounding the Project Site to the north and east. As a result, the Project design establishes an appropriate transition between the existing residences to the north and east and the proposed buildings on the Project Site. In response to community comments, the massing and scale of the proposed buildings have been markedly reduced through the use of lower-level pavilions separated by generous landscaped courtyards, considerable upper-level setbacks, and variations in architectural style and materials. Along Yuma Street, further reductions in mass and scale have been achieved through substantial ground-level building setbacks. For example, the distance at ground-level between Building 1 and the existing residences along Yuma Street ranges between 96 and 137 feet.
- **UD-2.2.5: Creating Attractive Facades** – This policy promotes visual interest through well-designed building facades that do not contain monolithic building forms and long blank walls that detract from the streetscape. The architectural design of the proposed buildings is anything but monolithic and blank. Rather, the careful sculpting of the building massing and the detailed façade design that takes cues from the surrounding context will add a substantial degree of visual interest to the neighborhood and to the quality of the streetscape.
- **UD-2.2.7: Infill Development** – This policy seeks to avoid overpowering contrasts in scale, height, and density as infill development occurs. In response to community comments, the Applicant has incorporated several design gestures that also serve to mitigate potential impacts on the surrounding neighborhood. These gestures include substantial reductions in height and penthouse footprint, ground-level and upper-level setbacks, construction of multiple building types (apartment building and townhomes), and provision of open courtyards and substantial landscaping. As a result, the Project will not result in overpowering contrasts in scale in relation to the surrounding context. Rather, the Project will establish an appropriate transition between the lower-scale residential development to the north and east and the commercial center and larger-scale AU Building to the south and west.
- **UD-2.2.8: Large Site Development** – This policy promotes the integration of larger development sites with adjacent sites by breaking development into multiple buildings and more varied forms. The Project is effective at integrating the redevelopment of the Valor Lot into the surrounding context by proposing multiple buildings types (apartment building and townhomes) that are designed in a context-sensitive manner using separate but complementary architectural styles, and by improving circulation through the Project Site by providing pedestrian improvements along the north-south alley between Yuma Street and Massachusetts Avenue. In addition, despite the large size of the Project Site, the substantial ground-level setbacks, lower initial building heights, and landscaped courtyards and open spaces proposed along 48th and Yuma Streets establish an appropriate transition between the lower-scale residential area to the north and east, and the commercial center and larger-scale AU Building to the south and west

f. Historic Preservation Element

The goal of the Comprehensive Plan’s Historic Preservation Element is to “[p]reserve and enhance the unique cultural heritage, beauty, and identity of the District of Columbia by respecting the historic physical form of the city and the enduring value of its historic structures and places, recognizing their importance to citizens of the District and the nation, and sharing mutual responsibilities for their protection and stewardship.” As one tool to achieve the preservation of historic properties, the Comprehensive Plan contains policies that promote the development and maintenance of “preservation incentives.” The Project is not inconsistent with these goals, and specifically the following policies:

- **HP-2.4.3: Compatible Development** – The focus of this policy is on preserving the important historic features of the District while permitting compatible new infill development that is in scale with and respects historic context through sensitive siting and design, and appropriate use of materials and architectural detail. The Project Site, located in the MU-4 zone, is a transitional site: to the north and east are primarily two-story single family dwellings, and to the west and south are commercial properties ranging in height from one to five stories, including the AU Building and historic MAPS. The proposed Project successfully responds to both of these contexts and is compatible with the historic context of the MAPS. The Project successfully relates to the scale of the single family neighborhood to the north and east, which is not historic, through the use of lower initial and overall building heights, substantial ground-level and upper-level setbacks, reductions in mass using courtyards and open spaces, and context-sensitive materials and architectural style. At the same time, the Project also respects and complements the scale and historic context of the MAPS through façade articulation and compatibility in architectural style and materials.
- **HP-3.1.2: Incentives for Special Property Types** – This policy promotes the development of specialized incentives to support preservation of historic properties that have exceptional communal value through a variety of tools that can reduce development pressure on these resources and/or help with unusually high cost of maintenance. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy because it will allow the Applicant to shift unused density from the MAPS site (Lots 802 and 803) to the Valor Lot (Lot 807) which will help protect the historic MAPS from future additional development by significantly reducing the amount of unused density on the MAPS site.

g. Transportation Element

The Transportation Element of the Comprehensive Plan provides policies and actions to maintain and improve the District’s transportation system and enhance the travel choices of current and future residents. These policies are complemented by policies in the Land Use, Urban Design, and Environmental Protection elements on related topics such as air quality and the management of public space. The goal of the Transportation Element is to “[c]reate a safe, sustainable, efficient multi-modal transportation system that meets the access and mobility needs of District residents, the regional workforce, and visitors; supports local and regional economic prosperity; and enhances the quality of life for District residents.” The Project is not inconsistent with the policies of the Transportation Element that are applicable to the proposed development, including the following:

T-1.1.2: Land Use Impact Assessment – This policy promotes the use of multi-modal standards rather than traditional vehicle standards when assessing the transportation impacts of development projects in order to more accurately measure and more effectively mitigate impacts on the transportation network. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy. As will be thoroughly documented in the Applicant’s Comprehensive Transportation Review (“CTR”), a multi-modal standard will be utilized to analyze the potential transportation-related impacts of the Project. Specifically, the CTR will provide mode splits used to estimate the potential number of the trips generated by the residential and retail components of the Project. These mode splits will be identified in coordination with the District Department of Transportation (“DDOT”) and will take into account Census data for the residents that live near the Project Site and the location of the Project Site relative to transit. Tailoring the mode-splits to the Project location will not only help the Applicant more accurately measure potential impacts, but will also help devise a robust set of transportation improvements and Transportation Demand Management (“TDM”) strategies that will effectively mitigate potential impacts on the transportation network.

T-1.1.B: Transportation Improvements – This recommended Comprehensive Plan action promotes requirements for TDM measures and transportation support facilities to be included in large development projects and major trip generators. The Project is not inconsistent with this recommended action. The Applicant will provide a wide range of TDM strategies that are aimed at reducing the demand for single-occupancy, private vehicles during peak period travel times or shifting single-occupancy vehicular demand to off-peak periods. The Applicant will also provide pedestrian network improvements, including the removal of approximately 80 linear feet of curb cuts, the creation of new pedestrian connections through and around the Project Site, construction of pedestrian curb extensions at select intersections, and, subject to evaluation and approval by DDOT, the construction of a High-Intensity Activated Crosswalk (“HAWK”) signal along Massachusetts Avenue.

T-1.2.3: Discouraging Auto-Oriented Uses – This policy discourages certain auto-oriented uses such as “drive-through” businesses or stores with large surface parking lots along key boulevards and pedestrian streets. It also promotes the minimization of curb cuts in new developments in order to increase pedestrian safety and maintain active and comfortable streetscapes. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy as it will permanently eliminate approximately 80 linear feet of curb cuts along Yuma and 48th Streets, and move all parking and loading access to Lot 807 to existing public and private alleys. The Project will also replace the large surface parking lot that currently occupies Lot 807 with a new mixed-use development that improves pedestrian connectivity through and around the Project Site, improves safety and the quality of the streetscape, and activates the Project Site through several aesthetic improvements to public space.

T-2.2.2: Connecting District Neighborhoods – This policy calls for improvements to connections between District neighborhoods through upgraded transit, auto, pedestrian, and bike connections, and by removing or minimizing existing physical barriers. As part of the Project, the Applicant will carry out several upgrades to pedestrian, bike, and auto connections that will improve connections through and around the Project Site, and between the commercial centers and neighborhoods located on the east and west sides of Massachusetts Avenue. These improvements include the reconstruction of the streetscape

adjacent to Lot 807, including the permanent removal of substantial curb cuts, the construction of pedestrian curb extensions at select intersections and other pedestrian improvements along existing alleys, and the construction of a HAWK signal on Massachusetts Avenue, subject to evaluation and approval by DDOT.

T-2.3.3: Bicycle Safety – This policy promotes increasing bicycle safety through traffic calming measures and improvements to bicycle access through the provision of public bike parking and elimination of barriers to bicycle travel. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy. Specifically, the Project will contain new short- and long-term bicycle parking, bicycle repair stations, and shower and locker facilities for retail employees. In addition, the substantial improvements to the streetscape, including the permanent removal of curb cuts, will result in further improvements to bicycle access and safety.

T-2.3.A: Bicycle Facilities – This policy recommends that bicycle facilities such as secure bicycle parking and lockers, bike racks, and shower facilities be included in new commercial and residential buildings, where feasible. The Project will contain all of these bicycle facilities and amenities, and thus is not inconsistent with this policy.

T-2.4.1: Pedestrian Network – This policy promotes the development, maintenance, and improvement of pedestrian facilities, including improvements to the District’s sidewalks to form a network that links residents across the city. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy. As described above, the Project contains several substantial improvements to the pedestrian network that will improve pedestrian safety through and around the Project Site, and between nearby neighborhoods. These include the permanent removal of approximately 80 linear feet of curb cut; reconstruction of the streetscape adjacent to Lot 807, including new sidewalks and tree box areas; construction of pedestrian curb extensions at select intersections; and the creation of new pedestrian connections through improvements to the north-south alley between Yuma Street and Massachusetts Avenue. Subject to evaluation and approval by DDOT, the Applicant will also construct a new HAWK signal along Massachusetts Avenue which will improve pedestrian connectivity between the shopping centers and neighborhoods on either side of the Massachusetts Avenue corridor.

T-2.4.2: Pedestrian Safety – This policy promotes improvements to safety and security at key pedestrian nodes. As described above, the Project contains several substantial improvements to the pedestrian network that will improve pedestrian safety through and around the Project site, and between nearby neighborhoods.

T-3.1.1: Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Programs – This policy encourages providing, supporting, and promoting programs and strategies aimed at reducing the number of car trips and miles driven to increase the efficiency of the transportation system. The Project is not inconsistent with this policy as the Applicant will implement a robust set of TDM strategies that will reduce the number of trips generated by the Project and mitigate potential impacts to the surrounding transportation system.

T-3.1.3: Car-Sharing – The Project is not inconsistent with this policy which encourages the expansion of car-sharing services as an alternative to private vehicle ownership. The Project will contain car sharing parking spaces within the parking garage on Lot 807, and as part of

its TDM strategies, the Applicant will work with DDOT to offer car-sharing benefits to residents of the project. In addition, as described in the application statement, for the first year of occupancy the Applicant will provide residents of the Project a shuttle service to the Tenleytown Metrorail station during certain peak commute hours.

T-3.1.A: TDM Strategies – This recommended Comprehensive Plan action encourages the development of strategies and requirements that reduce rush hour traffic by, among others, promoting carpooling and transit use; encouraging the formation of Transportation Management Associations; and undertaking other measures that reduce vehicular trips, particularly during peak travel periods. This action also recommends identifying TDM measures and plans as appropriate conditions for large development approval. The Project is not inconsistent with this recommended Comprehensive Plan action. As described above, the Project will include a robust set of TDM strategies that will be implemented by the Applicant. These strategies will reduce the number of trips generated by the Project through a variety of programs and actions, which the Applicant will identify and finalize with DDOT through the PUD review process.

T-3.2.D – Unbundle Parking Costs – This Comprehensive Plan action recommends finding ways to unbundle the cost of parking from residential units, thus allowing those purchasing or renting property to opt out of buying or renting parking spaces. The Applicant will work with DDOT throughout the PUD application review process to determine whether the cost of residential parking will be unbundled from the cost of leasing or purchasing a residential dwelling unit.

5. Consistency with Rock Creek West Area Element

The Rock Creek West Area Element encompasses 13 square miles in the northwest quadrant of the Washington, DC, and is generally bounded by Rock Creek on the east, Maryland on the north and west, and the Potomac River and Whitehaven Parkway on the south. The Rock Creek West area contains some of the District's most highly sought after neighborhoods, public schools, and most important natural and cultural resources. It also contains some of the most vibrant retail areas. The Project is not inconsistent with the policies and goals of the Rock Creek West Area Element that pertain to infill development and promotion of neighborhood-serving retail, including those specifically discussed below.

- **RCW-1.1.1: Neighborhood Conservation** – This policy is focused on the protection of the low density residential neighborhoods located west of Rock Creek Park. As discussed above, the Project has been carefully designed and extensively refined in response to community input, such that the proposed buildings on the Valor Lot successfully relate in scale to the nearby single family neighborhood to the north and east. As demonstrated in the Plans, the proposed design of Building 1 and adjacent townhomes, together with the substantial separation provided by Yuma and 48th Streets (both 90 foot wide rights-of-way), successfully integrate the Project into the surrounding context in a manner that protects the character of the neighborhood while also establishing an appropriate transition to the larger-scale AU Building and commercial center to the south.

· **RCW-1.1.3: Conserving Neighborhood Commercial Centers** – This policy supports local-serving retail uses and protection of neighborhood commercial centers from large office buildings and other non-neighborhood serving uses. The policy also promotes compatible new uses such as multi-family housing “to meet affordable housing needs, sustain neighborhood-serving retail and small businesses, and bring families back to the District.” The Project will advance this policy by providing a new mixed-use development consisting of a new full-service grocery store that will address the community’s desire to have this type of use in close proximity, and will complement the existing retail and service uses in the neighborhood. In addition, the Project will provide approximately 219 new residential dwelling units, including several larger-sized units, that will help families move into the neighborhood, allow long-term residents to remain in the neighborhood, and help address the growing demand for affordable housing in an area of the city that has very few affordable dwelling units.

· **RCW-1.1.4: Infill Development** – This policy recognizes the opportunity for infill development within the areas designated for commercial land use on the FLUM, such as the Project Site. For these types of sites, the policy encourages coordination with the ANCs, residents, and community organizations to develop projects that combine housing and commercial uses rather than only containing a single use. In addition, the policy promotes heights and densities that are informed by, and relate to, the scale and character of the surroundings. The Project is exactly the type of mixed-use development that is promoted by this policy as it involves mixed-use, infill development on an underutilized site that is designated for low-density commercial uses on the FLUM and primarily designated as a designated Neighborhood Commercial Center on the GPM.

· **RCW-1.1.5: Preference for Local-Serving Retail** – This policy supports new commercial development within the Rock Creek West Planning area that provides the range of goods and services necessary to meet the needs of local residents. The policy specifically states that local-serving retail uses are preferable to larger-scale retail uses that serve a regional market, and that “destination” retail uses are not appropriate in smaller-scale commercial areas, especially those without Metrorail access. The policy further states that regardless of scale, retail development must be planned and designed to mitigate traffic, parking, and other impacts on adjacent residential areas. The Project is fully consistent with the goals of this policy. For example, the Project will provide a new full-service grocery store that has been sized in direct response to community input regarding the need to balance the type of full-service grocery store desired by the community with potential impacts on traffic and parking. Thus, the size of the new grocery store and the overall amount of retail and service uses in the Project is consistent with the Project Site’s Neighborhood Commercial Center GPM designation and is appropriate given the Project Site’s location. Further, the Applicant will implement a variety of TDM strategies and a robust Loading Management Plan, which will successfully mitigate any potential impacts on traffic and parking. The Project has also been designed to mitigate any other potential impacts on the residential areas to the north and east.