
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Landmark/District:	Sixteenth Street Historic District/ Lafayette Square Historic District	(x) Agenda () Consent
Address:	800 16th Street, NW	
Meeting Date:	June 28, 2007	() New Construction
Case Number:	07-237	(x) Addition
Date Received:	March 29, 2007¹	() Alteration
Staff Reviewer:	Tim Dennée	(x) Concept

The applicant requests the Board's conceptual review of a proposal to construct a one-story addition atop the Hay-Adams Hotel building. The addition would accommodate a kitchen and dining room, plus a fitness center, wrapped around the mechanical penthouse. The street-facing elevations of the addition would be mainly glazed in the interest of creating views for diners. Just behind the parapet of the building would be a metal lattice which, with the awnings it would support, would reduce the reflectivity of the glazing by putting it in shadow and screening views to it.

Although the building is at the height limit under the zoning regulations, a provision was placed in the Comprehensive Plan supporting a one-story (maximum 16-foot-tall) rooftop addition. It is an unusual circumstance in the sense that, while it can direct zoning changes, the Comp Plan cannot override the zoning regulations in force, meaning that a PUD or some other means would probably be necessary to achieve this end.

This project is also subject to review by the United States Commission of Fine Arts, in accordance with the Shipstead-Luce Act. The Commission has recommended conceptual approval for the project, with the condition that the lattice be painted a dark color. The HPRB shares jurisdiction with the Commission in this and many other areas, including other portions of the Shipstead-Luce area, Georgetown, and at landmarked District of Columbia properties. As the HPRB is primarily a preservation review body and the Commission primarily a design review one, there are naturally occasional differences in recommendations. The case is before the Board because the staff anticipated some disagreement in this instance on the degree of setback necessary.

The Board has generally held that compatibility with an historic building would require that any rooftop addition (or deck) not be visible from the street. In the present case, this would not be

¹ The reason for the delay in hearing a case that was submitted at the end of March is that, for some reason, it was not initially filed for HPRB review, received no HPA number, and thus, was not routed to the Historic Preservation Office. It was not until we received the paperwork from the Commission regarding its conceptual approval that we became aware of the project. We then scheduled it for the next available hearing.

possible. One could argue that this is a more urgent concern in this case, as the addition would be very visible, indeed almost completely visible from the White House, Lafayette Square and Pennsylvania Avenue, as are the present tents atop the building that accommodate the television cameras filming the White House. In addition, as emphasized in the recent designation of lower 16th Street, the maintenance of the consistent 90-foot cornice height that characterizes the south end of the avenue is very important.

There is a historic tradition of rooftop additions and penthouses, many of which were set back from the main wall plane. Such an addition is conceivable in this case as, with the height of the building, an addition could be situated in such a way as appear natural or compatible. Although the proposed addition is set back, the setback is minimal—at about five to eight feet from the leading edge of the parapet—with the lattice screening and rail about two to five feet back. The difficulty this presents is one of the juxtaposition of the formal composition of massive, classical masonry below, including its very definitive upward termination, with whatever surmounts it. A prominent addition here is a real challenge to compatibility. Again, this lattice may play a crucial screening function for the glazed addition, but the entire structure should be set further back, in accordance with Board practice with regard to similar buildings, so that whatever the material and expression—lattice, glazing or solid wall—of the addition's elevations become less crucial altogether. For intentionally visible² rooftop additions and penthouses, a rule of thumb standard is a one-to-one ratio of setback distance to the height of the structure, consistent with zoning requirements relating to penthouses, although in this case it is uncertain as to whether the wall itself or the lattice screen should be set back to that distance.

The staff recommends that the Board support the concept of a one-story addition, albeit one that is set back from the elevations at a one-to-one ratio, height to setback distance, at minimum. Any Board support should not be construed as an endorsement of any necessary zoning relief.

5045721_v1

² As opposed to additions that are incidentally visible when no further setback is possible or when meant to look like they are the tops of buildings standing behind the subject property.

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
JUNE 28, 2007

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on June 28, 2007.

HISTORIC LANDMARK NOMINATION

Martin Luther King Memorial Library, 901 G Street, NW, Case #06-01.

The staff report was approved indicating the Martin Luther King Memorial Library qualifies for listing in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites as a historic landmark with specific designation of a portion of the interior. The interior designation encompass the public spaces of the first floor, an area clearly representative of Mies' design principles for the building's interior space. Vote 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK AND CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Tregaron, 3100 Macomb Street, NW, HPA #07-173, revised concept/construction of two houses.

The HPRB asked the architect to investigate further reductions in the height of House 1 through reductions in floor heights and redesign of the dormer; otherwise, revised conceptual design approved. Vote 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

O Street Market, 1400 7th Street NW, HPA #07-103, concept/adjacent new construction.

Board approved revisions to concept which reduced portions of 110' towers roof to 90', lowered 9th Street bays to six stories, included retail pavilions on 8th Street, lowered cube adjacent to historic market to 80' and redesigned building behind Market. No formal action taken.

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

1909-1913 Martin Luther King Jr. Avenue SE, HPA #06-xxx, revised concept/demolition and façade stabilization.

The Board approved the proper shoring of the facades and the subsequent demolition of the party walls, and the remaining framing and the removal of debris. The applicant and its assigns are required to retain, record, maintain and keep secure the facades. Further, the owner will appropriately rehabilitate them within the context of a new project subject to further Board review and discuss further with the Board the condition of its other properties located within historic districts. Finally, the project is delegated to staff for permit review of the demolition and shoring. Vote 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

814 L Street SE, HPA #06-162, raze one-story frame building.

The HPRB adopted the staff report with one revision to the third recommendation changing the word require to request. Vote 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Eastern Market, 225 7th Street, SE, HPA #06-179, concept/reconstruction and renovations.

The HPRB approved the renovations as proposed with the exception of adding interior vestibules and delegated final approval to staff was approved. Vote 8-0.

~~522 7th Street SE, HPA #07-267, concept/new construction.~~

This case was deferred to the July 26 Hearing.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2201 – 2211 14th Street NW, HPA #07-268, concept/alteration, new construction.

The HPRB approved revised massing that reorganized one-story YMCA entrance two bays to the west and reduced seven story height of new tower immediately behind three historic buildings by two floors. Vote 8-0.

1821 15th Street NW, HPA #07-134, concept/new four-unit apartment building.

The HPRB found the proposal to be incompatible with the character of its site; an alternative option that was more closely based on the historic context and former building on the site was found generally compatible and worthy of further exploration, as long as massing and footprint were respectful of the adjacent row. Vote 7-1.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1855 Lamont Street NW, HPA #06-105, revised concept/three-story rear addition.

This case was not reviewed at request of applicant.

LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT/SIXTEENTH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

Hay-Adams Hotel, 800 16th Street NW, HPA #07-237, concept/roof addition.

The staff report recommending the Board support the concept of a one-story addition that is set back from the existing elevations was approved. Vote 7-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK AND GEORGETOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

Williams-Addison House, 1645 31st Street NW, HPA #07-267, subdivision for new construction.

The staff report recommending the Board deny the subdivision as proposed and refer the application to the Mayor's Agent was approved. Vote 6-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

JUNE 28, 2007

The Historic Preservation Review Board considered the following consent items on June 28, 2007. All items were proposed for approval by the Board based upon the written record, without discussion passed by a vote of 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK NOMINATIONS

Cavalier Apartment Building, 3500 14th Street, NW, Case #07-35.

The staff report recommending the Board designate the Cavalier Apartment Building as a District of Columbia landmark and forward the nomination to the National Register of the Historic Places passed without comment.

Historic Landmarks

Arena Stage, 1101 6th Street NW, HPA #07-224, revised concept.

The staff report recommending the Board find the revisions consistent with the design concept and delegate further review to the staff passed without comment.

~~Tregaron, 3100 Macomb Street, NW, HPA #07-173, revised concept/construction of two houses.~~

This case was moved to the regular Agenda.

Capitol Hill Historic District

816 East Capitol Street NE, HPA# 07-222, concept/rear third floor addition.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the project in concept delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

1117 East Capitol St SE, HPA #07-150, rear addition, basement excavation, roof deck.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the addition as proposed delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

~~Eastern Market, 225 7th Street, SE, HPA #06-179, concept/reconstruction and renovations.~~

This case was moved to the Regular Agenda

111 2nd Street NE, HPA #07-270, two-story rear addition.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the addition as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act passed without comment.

121 6th Street NE, HPA #07-271, rear addition.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the project in concept delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

Cleveland Park Historic District

3429 Ordway Street NW, HPA #07-229, revised concept/rear addition.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the addition as proposed delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

3202 Rowland Place, NW, HPA #07-265, alterations to side façade.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the addition as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act passed without comment.

3315 Rowland Place, NW, HPA #07-273, addition/alterations to rear façade.

The staff report recommending Board approval of proposed alterations to the rear façade including an elevator shaft no higher than the second floor not to impact the existing roof line delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

Fourteenth Street and Logan Circle Historic Districts

1330 13th Street, NW, HPA #07-264, concept/roof addition.

The staff report recommending approval of the addition along with further study and refinement delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

Mount Pleasant Historic District

1620 Newton Street, NW, HPA #07-285, revised concept/subdivision and new construction of row house.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the new construction with conditions delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

Sheridan Kalorama Historic District

2438 Belmont Road, NW, HPA #07-190, alterations, two-story rear addition.

The staff report recommending HPRB approval of the concept design for a two-story addition was approved without comment.

Takoma Park Historic District

606 Aspen Street NW, HPA #07-166, alteration/rear addition, screen porch and deck

The staff report recommending Board approval of the addition as designed delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

U Street Historic District

1513 T Street, NW, HPA #07-274, concept/rear addition.

The staff report recommending Board approval of the concept proposal delegating final approval to staff passed without comment.

DENIAL CALENDAR

The following item is proposed for denial by the Board based upon the written record, without discussion.

Downtown Historic District

627 I Street, NW, HPA #06-530, raze.

The staff report recommending the Board find the demolition of 627 I Street not consistent with the purposes of the preservation law passed without comment.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing. Copies of individuals staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are available upon request. Please contact HPO at 202.442.8835 for more details.