

April 26, 2021

Mr. Frederick Hill Chairperson Board of Zoning Adjustment 441 4th Street NW, Suite 210S Washington, DC 20001 <u>bzasubmissions@dc.gov</u>

RE: 1733 16th Street NW (BZA #20452 and BZA #20453)

Dear Chairperson Hill,

At its regular meeting on April 14, 2021, the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission ("ANC 2B" or "Commission") considered the above-referenced matter. With 9 of 9 Commissioners in attendance, a quorum at a duly-noticed public meeting, the Commission approved the following resolution by a vote of (7-1-1):

WHEREAS, the Dupont East Civic Action Association (DECAA; appellant) and Michael Hays (appellant) have submitted related appeals to the Board of Zoning Adjustment (BZA) regarding a decision made on November 19, 2020 by the Zoning Administrator to approve the subdivision of Square 192, Lot 108 into two separate lots denoted as Lot 110 and Lot 111,

WHEREAS, the subdivision will encompass land that is currently vacant, having been cleared of the dwellings formerly occupying it between 1920 and the early 1990s, and now maintained as private open space,

WHEREAS, the appeals are in the context of a proposed new development which the ANC has reviewed several times in proceedings before the Historic Preservation Review Board (see Appendices A-D), and

WHEREAS, ANC 2B's Land Use Committee (LUC) on April 7, 2021 and ANC 2B on April 14, 2021 considered the appellants cases and were not convinced to support the appeals.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B does not support appeals #20452 and #20453 as presented in April of 2021.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that, given the significant local interest in this matter and confusion surrounding old and new zoning laws regarding these appeals, in order to support

future development proposals, ANC 2B requests that the Board of Zoning Adjustment in its ruling confirms that the subdivision does not create nonconforming lot(s), including a brief explanation of what the agency finds is the applicable zoning law regarding which facade of a corner building can be designated as the front for purposes of calculating rear and side yard setbacks; confirms what constitutes an embellishment and how that impacts building height measurement; and clarifies baseline ground measurement accounting for the temple's existing areaways.

Commissioners Mo Pasternak (<u>2B04@anc.dc.gov</u>) and Daniel Warwick (<u>2B02@anc.dc.gov</u>) are the Commission's representatives in this matter.

ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION.

Donne Warnick

Daniel Warwick Chair

Appendix A

ANC 2B's November 2018 Resolution Regarding the Historic Preservation Review Board Application for 1733 16th Street NW



November 21, 2018

Marnique Heath, Chair Historic Preservation Review Board Office of Planning 1100 4th Street SW, Suite E650 Washington, DC 20024 <u>historic.preservation@dc.gov</u>

RE: 1733 16th Street NW (HPRB #18-668)

Dear Chairwoman Heath:

At its regular meeting on November 14, 2018, the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission ("ANC 2B" or "Commission") considered the above-referenced matter. With 7 of 8 Commissioners in attendance, a quorum at a duly-noticed public meeting, the Commission approved the following resolution by a vote of (6-1-0):

WHEREAS, the project as proposed is within the 16th Street Historic District, the 14th Street Historic District, and Advisory Neighborhood Commission 2B,

WHEREAS, the project proposes to construct an apartment building on a currently vacant parcel at the corner of 15th Street and S Street NW, which was occupied by row houses more than 30 years ago,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands that the project is to be developed as a matter of right under the zoning code,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B heard from several constituents that preserving views of the apse of the Scottish Rite Temple from 15th Street is more important than the preservation of the current carriage house contributing structure,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B urges the applicant to rethink the proposed window treatment of the carriage house and to focus more on the garage-style windows and less on the small upper windows,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates the applicant's proposed setbacks along 15th Street and S Street, which mimic setbacks on neighboring properties, WHEREAS, ANC 2B additionally appreciates the applicant's setback on the southern portion of the building between the proposed parking garage entrance and 15th Street, and encourages the applicant to maintain the streetscape so that the broadest amount of visibility is available where the alley meets the 15th Street protected cycle track,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B would appreciate, and the applicant has offered, a light study to illuminate concerns regarding shadows from the proposed project,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates that the proposed areaways allow for an additional level of cellar / English basement units, which provide much needed housing, add to the amount of Inclusionary Zoning required for the project, and likely provide a greater overall price range for units,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B believes that the proposed areaways are appropriately set back and covered in foliage so that they are not a historic preservation concern,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands the intent of the corner treatments of the project's street frontage, but believes that these portions of the building make the structure too complicated, and

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates brick treatment that integrates with neighboring buildings and responds to community input, but believes that the current design is overly complicated and incompatible with existing historic structures.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to redesign the corner treatments to be more congruent with the row house nature of 15th Street and S Street.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B urges the applicant to rethink the window treatment on the carriage house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to consider a more muted color tone through yellow or light red bricks and to simplify the design overall so that any variation in material and design is more subtle and more consistent with nearby properties.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B requests that changes in the concept review proposal go back through the Historic Preservation Review Board rather than be delegated to Historic Preservation Office staff so that the ANC may continue to formally weigh in on this project.

Commissioners Daniel Warwick (<u>2B02@anc.dc.gov</u>) and Amy Johnson (<u>2B01@anc.dc.gov</u>) are the Commission's representatives in this matter.

ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION.

Jame Warnick \int

Daniel Warwick Chair

Appendix B

ANC 2B's May 2019 Resolution Regarding the Historic Preservation Review Board Concept Application for 1733 16th Street NW



May 21, 2019

Marnique Heath, Chair Historic Preservation Review Board Office of Planning 1100 4th Street SW, Suite E650 Washington, DC 20024 <u>historic.preservation@dc.gov</u>

RE: 1733 16th Street NW Concept Application (HPRB #18-668)

Dear Chairwoman Heath:

At its special meeting on May 16, 2019, the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission ("ANC 2B" or "Commission") considered the above-referenced matter. With 9 of 9 Commissioners in attendance, a quorum at a duly-noticed public meeting, the Commission approved the following resolution by a vote of (8-1-0):

WHEREAS, the project as proposed is within the 16th Street Historic District, the 14th Street Historic District, and Advisory Neighborhood Commission 2B,

WHEREAS, the project proposes to construct an apartment building on a currently vacant parcel at the corner of 15th Street and S Street NW, which was occupied by row houses more than 30 years ago,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates that the applicant has shared a light study to illuminate concerns regarding shadows from the proposed project,

WHEREAS, at the previous concept review for this project ANC 2B requested the following:

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to redesign the corner treatments to be more congruent with the row house nature of 15th Street and S Street.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B urges the applicant to rethink the window treatment on the carriage house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to consider a more muted color tone through yellow or light red bricks and to

simplify the design overall so that any variation in material and design is more subtle and more consistent with nearby properties.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B requests that changes in the concept review proposal go back through the Historic Preservation Review Board rather than be delegated to Historic Preservation Office staff so that the ANC may continue to formally weigh in on this project.

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates that the applicant has responded to these concerns,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B further understands, based on Historic Preservation Review Board guidance, that the applicant has created a linear park between the proposed new development and the Masonic Temple in an area that roughly corresponds to the alley which historically existed in Square 192 before being vacated by the city,

WHEREAS, though ANC 2B understands that the alley was vacated by the city, the area of the landscaped linear park has historically served a circulation purpose,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B believes that separation between the new development and the historic landmark structure is vital to the contextual understanding of the two structures as of different times and uses, and

WHEREAS, ANC 2B believes that the contextual understanding of the differences between the structures is diminished by a physical barrier or gate bringing the two structures together by blocking the linear park from S Street NW or the alley.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B supports the project as proposed provided that no physical barriers are erected at the north and south ends of the linear park, abutting S Street NW and the alley.

Commissioners Aaron Landry (<u>2B04@anc.dc.gov</u>) and Daniel Warwick (<u>2B02@anc.dc.gov</u>) are the Commission's representatives in this matter.

ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION.

June Warnick

Daniel Warwick Chair

Appendix C

ANC 2B's May 2019 Resolution Regarding the Historic Preservation Review Board Landmark Application for 1733 16th Street NW



May 21, 2019

Marnique Heath, Chair Historic Preservation Review Board Office of Planning 1100 4th Street SW, Suite E650 Washington, DC 20024 <u>historic.preservation@dc.gov</u>

RE: 1733 16th Street NW Landmark Application (HPRB #19-05)

Dear Chairwoman Heath:

At its special meeting on May 16, 2019, the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission ("ANC 2B" or "Commission") considered the above-referenced matter. With 9 of 9 Commissioners in attendance, a quorum at a duly-noticed public meeting, the Commission approved the following resolution by a vote of (8-1-0):

WHEREAS, the structure of the Scottish Rite Temple is within the 16th Street Historic District with adjacent space within the 16th Street Historic District and the 14th Street Historic District,

WHEREAS, the Scottish Rite Temple is a designated DC historic landmark,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands that due to the method in which the site was landmarked in 1964, no specific boundaries were defined,

WHEREAS, the Dupont East Civic Action Association (DECAA; applicant) has submitted an application to the Historic Preservation Review Board requesting that the boundary of the Scottish Rite Temple historic landmark be extended eastward to include the entirety of Lot 108, reaching to 15th Street NW,

WHEREAS, the expansion will encompass land that is currently vacant, having been cleared of the dwellings formerly occupying it between 1920 and the early 1990s, and currently contains a landscaped space which is not open to the public,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands that the Supreme Council has engaged a developer to construct a residential apartment building on the space east of the temple, and

WHEREAS, upon public discussion ANC 2B believes that the application lacks the necessary research to support an expansion of the landmark designation.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B does not support the application.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B requests that the Historic Preservation Review Board clarifies and resolves the specific site of the existing historic landmark.

Commissioners Aaron Landry (<u>2B04@anc.dc.gov</u>) and Daniel Warwick (<u>2B02@anc.dc.gov</u>) are the Commission's representatives in this matter.

ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION.

June Warnick

Daniel Warwick Chair

Appendix D

ANC 2B's September 2019 Resolution Regarding the Historic Preservation Review Board Application for 1733 16th Street NW



September 25, 2019

Marnique Heath, Chair Historic Preservation Review Board Office of Planning 1100 4th Street SW, Suite E650 Washington, DC 20024 <u>historic.preservation@dc.gov</u>

RE: 1733 16th Street NW (HPRB #19-497)

Dear Chair Heath:

At its regular meeting on September 11, 2019, the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission ("ANC 2B" or "Commission") considered the above-referenced matter. With 9 of 9 Commissioners in attendance, a quorum at a duly-noticed public meeting, the Commission approved the following resolution by a vote of (5-4-0):

The applicant at 1733 16th Street NW proposes to subdivide the existing Record Lot 108 on Square 192 into two lots in order to allow for the development of a residential building which Advisory Neighborhood Commission 2B reviewed in advance of the Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) concept review in November 2018 and May 2019.

In May 2019, HPRB approved a concept plan for the site including a proposed residential building. ANC 2B understands that the lot subdivision is requested by the applicant to enable the development of the approved concept plan.

The proposed lot division line is along the line of the historic division between Lot 800 and Lot 40 from before Lot 40 was consolidated into Lot 108, as well as being coterminous with the zoning dividing line between RA-9 and RA-8. ANC 2B believes that this makes it a reasonable location for a new lot division line to be located.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B supports the subdivision as presented.

Commissioners Aaron Landry (<u>2B04@anc.dc.gov</u>) and Daniel Warwick (<u>2B02@anc.dc.gov</u>) are the Commission's representatives in this matter.

ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION.

Danne Warnick

Daniel Warwick Chair