

REPORT TO THE ZONING COMMISSION

CASE NO. 07-13
THE CORCORAN-RANDALL SCHOOL
65 I STREET, S.W.

STEVEN E. SHER,
DIRECTOR OF ZONING AND LAND USE SERVICES
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP

DECEMBER 6, 2007

- I. Introduction
- II. Nature of applications
 - A. Consolidated review of planned unit development
 - B. Map amendment from R-4 to C-3-A or C-3-C
- III. Site location
 - A. 65 I Street, S.W., also known as 840 Half Street, S.W.
 - B. Block bounded by I Street on the south, former 1st Street on the west, partially-closed H Street on the north, and South Capitol Street on the east
- IV. Site description
 - A. Rectangular shaped property (Square S643, Lot 801)
 - B. Contains approximately 115,724 square feet of land area
 - C. Existing conditions: Occupied by the former Randall Junior High School including original 1906 building and numerous additions
- V. Description of the surrounding area
 - A. To the north:
 - 1. Partially-closed H Street
 - 2. Randall Recreation Center ballfields

ZONING COMMISSION
District of Columbia
CASE NO. 07-13
ZONING COMMISSION
District of Columbia
EXHIBIT NO. 64
CASE NO. 07-13
EXHIBIT NO. 64

3. Historic Friendship Baptist Church at 734 1st Street, on H Street east of Delaware Avenue (site of approved PUD for re-use of the church building as offices of a nonprofit organization and construction of a new apartment building with a maximum height of 70 feet and an overall maximum FAR of 2.66 – Z.C. Case No. 03-30, Order effective November 18, 2005)

B. To the east:

1. Randall Recreation Center ballfields
2. South Capitol Street
3. Larger commercial area being developed with office and residential uses

C. To the south:

1. I Street, S.W.
2. Friendship Baptist Church to the southwest at 900 Delaware Avenue
3. Bethel Pentecostal Tabernacle Church to the south
4. Best Western Downtown Capitol Hotel to the southeast
5. D.C. Vehicle inspection station and Fire Department facilities in the block south of K Street

D. To the west:

1. Former 1st Street, S.W.
2. Southwest Community Health Center at 850 Delaware Avenue
3. Capitol Park townhouses and Capital Plaza high-rise apartments west and northwest of Delaware Avenue
4. Greenleaf Homes south of I Street and west of Delaware Avenue
5. Closest residential building is almost 300 feet away

VI. Zoning

A. Existing zoning: R-4

1. Row dwellings and multi-family conversions

2. Maximum height: 40 feet and 3 stories
3. Minimum lot area: 1,800 square feet for row dwellings and flats, 3,000 square feet for semi-detached one-family dwellings, and 4,000 square feet for all other structures
4. Minimum lot width: 18 feet for row dwellings, 30 feet for semi-detached dwellings, and 40 feet for detached dwellings
5. Maximum percentage of lot occupancy: 60%
6. Side yards: not required
7. Minimum rear yard: 20 feet
8. Off-street parking:
 - a) For multiple dwelling residential use: 1 space for each 3 dwelling units
 - b) For college or institution of higher learning, business trade, or other school and accessory uses located on the campus: 2 spaces for each 3 teachers, plus either 1 for each 10 classroom seats or 1 for each 12 stadium seats or 1 for each 10 auditorium seats, whichever is greater
9. PUD guidelines
 - a) Height: 60 feet
 - b) FAR: 1.0
 - c) Yards and courts: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser
 - d) Parking and loading: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser

E. Proposed zoning:

1. Original Application: C-3-A
 - a) General commercial district, permitting a broad range of retail, service and office uses, hotels, residential uses (single and multi-family) and many institutional uses

- b) Maximum height: 65 feet
- c) Maximum FAR: 4.0, of which no more than 2.5 may be for other than residential purposes
- d) Side yards: not required
- e) Minimum rear yard: 2 ½ inches per foot of height, not less than 12 feet
- f) Off-street parking:
 - (1) For residential use: 1 space for each 2 dwelling units
 - (2) For college or institution of higher learning, business trade, or other school and accessory uses located on the campus: 2 spaces for each 3 teachers, plus either 1 for each 10 classroom seats or 1 for each 12 stadium seats or 1 for each 10 auditorium seats, whichever is greater
- g) PUD guidelines
 - (1) Height: 90 feet
 - (2) FAR: 4.5, of which no more than 3.0 may be for commercial uses
 - (3) Yards and courts: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser
 - (4) Parking and loading: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser

2. Alternative: C-3-C

- a) General commercial district permitting almost all retail, service and office uses, as well as hotel, residential and institutional uses
- b) Maximum height: 90 feet
- c) Maximum FAR: 6.5
- d) Maximum percentage of lot occupancy for residential building: 100%

- e) Minimum rear yard – 2½ inches per foot of height at the rear
- f) Side yard – not required
- g) Minimum required parking:
 - (1) For residential use: 1 space for each 4 dwelling units
 - (2) For college or institution of higher learning, business trade, or other school and accessory uses located on the campus: 2 spaces for each 3 teachers, plus either 1 for each 10 classroom seats or 1 for each 12 stadium seats or 1 for each 10 auditorium seats, whichever is greater
- h) PUD guidelines for C-3-C
 - (1) Height: 130 feet (limited to 110 feet by Act of 1910)
 - (2) FAR: 8.0
 - (3) Yards and courts: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser
 - (4) Parking and loading: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser

C. Zoning of the area

- 1. R-4 zoning to the north, east and west
- 2. C-3-A and C-3-C zoning to the south and southeast

VII. Description of the proposed project

- A. Mixed-use development that includes 440-490 residential condominium units, new facilities for the Corcoran College of Art and Design, and 3 levels of underground parking
- E. Height: maximum of 100 feet
- C. Floor area ratio: 4.32 (0.66 to be occupied by Corcoran facilities) – total gross floor area of 499,843 square feet

- D. Parking: 393 total spaces in underground garage
 - 1. 333 residential spaces
 - 2. 60 spaces for school or college use
- E. Comparison to matter-of-right and PUD standards for proposed zoning
 - 1. Uses: apartments and Corcoran uses permitted as a matter-of-right
 - 2. Height:
 - a) Matter-of-right: 90 feet
 - b) PUD guideline: 130 feet (limited to 110 feet under Height Act of 1910)
 - c) Proposed: maximum of 100 feet
 - 3. FAR:
 - a) Matter-of-right: maximum of 6.5
 - b) PUD: maximum of 8.0
 - c) Proposed: 4.32 (approximately 499,843 square feet of gross floor area)

VIII. Compliance with PUD evaluation standards of §2403

- A. Impact of project shall be favorable, capable of being mitigated or acceptable (§2403.3)
 - 1. Appropriate residential infill development in an area characterized by medium and high-density residential, as well as commercial and institutional uses
 - 2. Additional height is appropriate to derive proper massing scheme given relationships to existing landmark building
 - 3. Traffic will have no unacceptable impact on levels of service at build-out, per report by Wells & Associates
- B. Project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan (§2403.4): see section IX below

- C. Commission shall “judge, balance, and reconcile the relative value of project amenities and public benefits offered, the degree of development incentives requested and any potential adverse effects” (§2403.8)
- D. Public benefits and project amenities
 - 1. Culture, arts and education
 - a) Introduction of the Corcoran College of Art and Design to southwest Washington (arts education program)
 - b) "After School for All" program – supplement to DCPS Visual Arts curriculum
 - c) Elementary school partnership
 - d) Professional development for art teachers
 - e) Continuing education classes
 - 2. Housing (440-490 units)
 - 3. Affordable housing (20% of units at 80% of AMI)
 - 4. Historic preservation
 - a) Renovation and adaptive reuse of historic portions of Randall Junior High School
 - b) Preservation of rights-of-way of 1st and H Streets
 - 5. Employment opportunities and revenue for the city as indicated in economic analysis performed by Basile Baumann Prost & Associates
 - 6. First Source employment opportunities and MOU with Department of Small and Local Business Development

balanced against

- E. Development Incentives
 - 1. 10 foot increase in height over matter-of-right under C-3-C (to allow appropriate articulation of the zoning envelope)
 - 2. More than 250,000 square feet less than permitted as a matter-of-right under C-3-C

F. Areas of flexibility from C-3-A, C-3-C or PUD standards:

1. Courts

- a) Required: minimum width of court of 4 inches per foot of height but not less than 15 feet
- b) Provided: multiple courts at multiple levels, some not meeting the required width for the height

2. Loading facilities

- a) Required: 1 berth @ 55 feet deep, 1 berth @ 30 feet deep and 2 service/delivery loading spaces @ 20 feet deep
- b) Provided: 2 berths @ 40 feet deep and 2 berths @ 30 feet deep
- c) Flexibility requested: to have 1 berth be 40 feet deep instead of 55 feet deep

3. Roof structure relief

- a) Required: single enclosure, walls of equal height, setback 1:1 from exterior walls
- b) Provided: multiple enclosures, walls of differing heights and not meeting the 1:1 setbacks in all places

IX. Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan - The District Elements - The Comprehensive Plan Amendment Act of 2006 (D.C. Law 16-300, March 8, 2007)

A. Framework element – guiding principles

1. Managing growth and change

- a) "Change in the District is both inevitable and desirable. The key is to manage change in ways that protect the positive aspects of life in the city and reduce negatives such as poverty, crime, and homelessness." (§2.3, ¶217.1)
- b) "Diversity also means maintaining and enhancing the District's mix of housing types. Housing should be developed for households of different sizes, including growing families as well as singles and couples." (§2.3, ¶217.3)

- c) "The District needs both residential and non-residential growth to survive. Non-residential growth benefits residents by creating jobs and opportunities for less affluent households to increase their income." (§2.3, ¶217.4)
- d) "Redevelopment and infill opportunities along corridors and near transit stations will be an important component of reinvigorating and enhancing our neighborhoods. Development on such sites must not compromise the integrity of stable neighborhoods and must be designed to respect the broader community context. Adequate infrastructure capacity should be ensured as growth occurs." (§2.3, ¶217.6)
- e) "Growth in the District benefits not only District residents, but the region as well. By accommodating a larger number of jobs and residents, we can create the critical mass needed to support new services, sustain public transit, and improve regional environmental quality." (§2.3, ¶217.7)

2. Increasing access to education and employment

"An economically strong and viable District of Columbia is essential to the economic health and well being of the region. Thus, a broad spectrum of private and public growth (with an appropriate level of supporting infrastructure) should be encouraged. The District's economic development strategies must capitalize on the city's location at the center of the region's transportation and communication systems." (§2.3, ¶219.2)

B. Framework element – the Land Use Maps

- 1. The Generalized Policy Map purpose "is to categorize how different parts of the District may change between 2005 and 2025" (§2.4, ¶223)
- 2. Includes subject property in a Neighborhood Conservation Area, described as follows:

"Neighborhood Conservation areas have very little vacant or underutilized land. They are primarily residential in character. Maintenance of existing land uses and community character is anticipated over the next 20 years. Where change occurs, it will be modest in scale and will consist primarily of scattered site infill housing, public facilities, and institutional uses. Major changes in density over current (2005) conditions are not expected but some new development and reuse opportunities are anticipated." 223.4

"The guiding philosophy in Neighborhood Conservation Areas is to conserve and enhance established neighborhoods. Limited development and redevelopment opportunities do exist within these areas but they are small in scale. The diversity of land uses and building types in these areas should be maintained and new development and alterations should be compatible with the existing scale and architectural character of each area. Densities in Neighborhood Conservation Areas are guided by the Future Land Use Map." 223.5

3. The Future Land Use Map – includes property in medium density residential category, described as follows:

"This designation is used to defined neighborhoods or areas where mid-rise (4-7 stories) apartment buildings are the predominant use." (§2.4.2, ¶224.8)

4. Maps are intended to provide generalized guides for development and conservation decisions (§2.4.2, ¶224.24)
 - a) Future Land Use Map does not follow parcel boundaries and its categories do not specify allowable uses or dimensional standards
 - b) By definition Map is to be interpreted broadly
 - c) Future Land Use Map is generalized depiction of intended uses in the 20 year horizon
 - d) Densities within any given area are across-the-board; individual buildings may be higher or lower
 - e) Density bonuses through PUDs may result in heights that exceed typical ranges
 - f) Zoning is guided by the Future Land Use Map, interpreted in conjunction with the text of the Plan, including citywide elements, area elements and approved small area plans

C. Land Use element

1. Overall goal:

"Ensure the efficient use of land resources to meet long-term neighborhood, city-wide, and regional needs: to help foster other District goals, to protect the health, safety, and welfare of District residents and businesses; to sustain, restore, or improve the character and stability of neighborhoods in all parts of the city; and to effectively balance the competing demands for land to support the many activities that take place within District boundaries." (§302.1)

2. Policies and Actions

- a) Policy LU-1.1.5: Urban Mixed Use Neighborhoods: Encourage new central city mixed use neighborhoods combining high-density residential, office, retail, cultural, and open space uses in the ... South Capitol Street corridor/Stadium area. ... Housing, including affordable housing, is particularly encouraged and should be a vital component of the future land use mix. 10 DCMR § 304.10.
- b) Policy LU-2.1.4: Rehabilitation Before Demolition: In redeveloping areas characterized by vacant, abandoned, and underutilized older buildings, generally encourage rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of existing buildings rather than demolition. 10 DCMR § 309.9.
- c) Policy LU-2.1.12: Reuse of Public Buildings: Rehabilitate vacant or outmoded public and semi-public buildings for continued use. Reuse plans should be compatible with their surroundings, and should limit the introduction of new uses that could adversely affect neighboring communities. 10 DCMR § 309.16.

D. Housing element

1. Overall goal

"Develop and maintain a safe, decent, and affordable supply of housing for all current and future residents of the District of Columbia." (§501.1)

2. Homes for an Inclusive City - Expanding Housing Supply

- a) "Expanding the housing supply is a key part of the District's vision to create successful neighborhoods. Along with improved transportation and shopping, better neighborhood schools and parks, preservation of historic resources, and improved design and identity, the production of housing is essential to the future of our neighborhoods. It is also a key to improving the city's fiscal health. The District will work to facilitate housing construction and rehabilitation through its planning, building, and housing programs, recognizing and responding to the needs of all segments of the community. The first step toward meeting this goal is to ensure that an adequate supply of appropriately zoned land is available to meet expected housing needs." (§503.1)
- b) Policy H-1.1.1 Private Sector Support

"Encourage the private sector to provide new housing to meet the needs of present and future District residents at locations consistent with District land use policies and objectives." (§503.2)
- c) Policy H-1.1.4 Mixed Use Development

"Promote mixed use development, including housing, on commercially zoned land, particularly in neighborhood commercial centers, along Main Street mixed use corridors, and around appropriate Metrorail stations." (§503.5)
- d) Policy H-1.1.5 Housing Quality

"Require the design of affordable housing to meet the same high-quality architectural standards required of market-rate housing. Regardless of its affordability level, new or renovated housing should be indistinguishable from market rate housing in its exterior appearance and should address the need for open space and recreational amenities, and respect the design integrity of adjacent properties and the surrounding neighborhood." (§503.6)

e) Policy H-1.2.5 Workforce Housing

"In addition to programs targeting persons of very low and extremely low incomes, develop and implement programs that meet the housing needs of teachers, firefighters, police officers, nurses, city workers, and others in the public service professions with wages insufficient to afford market-rate housing in the city. 10 DCMR (§504.12)

E Economic Development element

1. Overall goal

"Strengthen the District's economy by sustaining its core industries, attracting new and diverse industries, accommodating future job growth, fostering the success of small businesses, revitalizing neighborhood commercial centers, improving resident job skills, and helping a greater number of District residents find and keep jobs in the Washington regional economy." (§701.1)

2. Policy ED-2.4.1: Institutional Growth: Support growth in the higher education and health care sectors. Recognize the potential of these industries to provide employment and income opportunities for District residents, and to enhance the District's array of cultural amenities and health care options. 10 DCMR § 710.3.

F. Urban Design element

1. Overall goal:

2. "Enhance the beauty and livability of the city by protecting its historic design legacy, reinforcing the identity of its neighborhoods, harmoniously integrating new construction with existing buildings and the natural environment, and improving the vitality, appearance, and security of streets and public spaces." (§901.1)

3. Policy UD-1.1.2: Reinforcing the L'Enfant and McMillan Plans: Respect and reinforce the L'Enfant and McMillan Plans to maintain the District's unique, historic and grand character. This policy should be achieved through a variety of urban design measures, including appropriate building placement, view protection, enhancement of the L'Enfant Plan reservations (green spaces), limits on street and alley closings ..., and the siting of new monuments and memorials in locations of visual prominence. Restore as appropriate and where possible, previously closed streets and alleys, and obstructed vistas or viewsheds. (§903.7)

G. Historic Preservation element

1. Overall goal:
 - a) "Preserve and enhance the unique cultural heritage, beauty, and identity of the District of Columbia by respecting the historic physical form of the city and the enduring value of its historic structures and places, recognizing their importance to the citizens of the District and the nation, and sharing mutual responsibilities for their protection and stewardship" (§1001.1)
 - b) Policy HP-1.3.1: Designation of Historic Properties: Recognize and protect significant historic properties through official designation as historic landmarks and districts under both District and federal law, maintaining consistency between District and federal listings whenever possible. (§1005.2)
 - c) Policy HP-2.3.1: The Plan of the City of Washington: Preserve the defining features of the L'Enfant and McMillan plans for Washington. Work jointly with federal agencies to maintain the public squares, circles, and major reservations as landscaped open spaces that provide a means to experience the legacy of the city plan. Preserve the historic pattern of streets and associated minor reservations, and protect these historic rights-of-way from incompatible incursions and intrusions. (§1010.3)
 - d) Policy HP-2.4.1: Rehabilitation of Historic Structures: Promote appropriate preservation of historic buildings through an effective design review process. Apply design guidelines without stifling creativity, and strive for an appropriate balance between restoration and adaptation suitable from the particular historic environment. (§1011.4)

- e) Policy HP-2.4.2: Adaptation of Historic Properties for Current Use: Maintain historic properties in their original use to the greatest extent possible. If this is no longer feasible, encourage appropriate adaptive uses consistent with the character of the property. (§1011.5)
- f) Policy HP-3.2.1: Preservation and Community Development: Promote historic preservation as a tool for economic and community development. (§1017.3)

H. Community Services and Facilities element

1. Overall goal:

Provide high-quality, accessible, efficiently managed, and properly funded community facilities to support the efficient delivery of municipal services, protect public health and safety, and enhance the well-being of current and future District residents.” (§1101.1)

2. Policy CSF-1.1.4: Addressing Facilities That Are Functionally Obsolete: Develop reuse or disposition plans for public buildings or sites that are functionally obsolete, that cannot be rehabilitated cost-effectively, or that are no longer needed. (§1103.10)

I. Arts and Culture element

1. Overall goal:

Support and encourage arts and cultural venues, programs and learning experiences in the District of Columbia that inspire a vibrant cultural life for all segments of the population. Enhance the city’s diverse artistic and cultural traditions through decisions affecting the physical environment. (§1401.1)

2. Policy AC-1.1.2: Development of New Cultural Facilities: Develop new neighborhood cultural facilities across the District, providing affordable space for grass roots and community arts organizations. Provide technical and financial assistance to organizations to help plan and build such facilities. (§1403.3)

3. Policy AC-1.1.3: Distribution of Facilities: Promote improved geographic distribution of arts and cultural facilities, including development of arts facilities and venues east of the Anacostia River and in other parts of the city where they are in short supply today. (§1403.4)

4. Policy AC-4.4.1: Arts Education Programs: Build a stronger constituency for the arts in the District through arts education in K-12 schools including attendance at arts performances and arts exhibitions, and support of adult art programs for persons of all ages and backgrounds. City resources should be used to help promote the strong and diverse arts programs offered by our public schools. (§1415.3)

J. Lower Anacostia Waterfront/Near Southeast Area element

1. Policy AW-2.2.1: South Capitol Street Urban Boulevard: Transform South Capitol Street into a great urban boulevard and “walking” street, befitting its role as a gateway to the U.S. Capitol and a major Anacostia River crossing. Development along the street should include a mix of federal, District, and private uses. (§1512.7)

X. Compatibility with the area

- A. Uses: permitted under proposed zoning
- B. Zoning generally compatible with areas to the south and southeast
- C. Adaptive reuse of existing structure

XI. Conclusions

- A. Project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan
- B. Project is within the applicable height and bulk standards of the Zoning Regulations
- C. Project provides an appropriate balance between the development proposed, the flexibility requested and the benefits and amenities provided
- D. PUD allows the Zoning Commission to condition approval to what is specifically proposed, without allowing more density or uncontrolled development
- E. Project should be approved