

Tel 202 955 3000 Fax 202 955 5564 Holland & Knight LLP 2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Suite 100 Washington, D.C. 20006-6801 www.hklaw.com

REPORT TO THE ZONING COMMISSION

CASE NO. 06-24 2400 14th STREET

STEVEN E. SHER, DIRECTOR OF ZONING AND LAND USE SERVICES HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP

JANUARY 25, 2007

- I. Introduction
- II. Nature of application: consolidated review of planned unit development
- III. Site location
 - A. West side of 14th Street between Belmont and Chapin Streets, N.W.
 - B. 14th Street corridor between Shaw/U Street and Columbia Heights area
- IV. Site description
 - A. Rectangular shaped property of approximately 320 feet in the north-south direction and 125 feet in the east-west direction (Square 2661, Lot 219)
 - B. Contains approximately 39,991 square feet of land area
 - C. Has frontage of approximately 320 feet on 14th Street and 125 feet on Belmont and Chapin Streets
 - D. Abuts 20 foot wide public alley on the west
 - E. Existing conditions:
 - 1. One story building extending all the way from Belmont to Chapin Streets devoted to retail and service uses

ZONING COMMISSION

District of Columbia

ZONING COMMISSION

CASE NO. Opicitic of Columbia

CASE NO. Opicitic of Columbia

CASE NO. Opicitic of Columbia

EXHIBIT NO. 37

EXHIBIT NO. 37

- 2. Surface parking lot facing 14th Street for 48 vehicles with access from both Belmont and Chapin Streets
- F. Abutting streets:
 - 1. 14^{th} Street -110 feet wide
 - 2. Belmont Street 65 feet wide
 - 3. Chapin Street 65 feet wide
- V. Description of the surrounding area (see aerial photograph, c. 2005, attached)
 - A. General area: 14th Street corridor contains mix of commercial and residential uses from Thomas Circle up to the Columbia Heights area
 - B. Remainder of Square 2661:
 - 1. Vacant lot to the west along Chapin Street
 - 2. Midrise apartment houses (3-5 stories) along remainder of Chapin Street frontage west to 15th Street
 - 3. Midrise apartment houses (3-5 stories) along Belmont Street frontage
 - 4. PUD known as the Fedora at 1451 Belmont Street for 103 residential units in a 55 foot high building
 - C. To the north:
 - 1. Police Boys and Girls Club on the west side of 14th Street between Chapin and Clifton Streets
 - 2. Additional mixed residential and commercial development at varying heights
 - D. To the east:
 - 1. Wardman Court apartments (formerly known as Clifton Terrace) on the east side of 14th Street between Belmont and Clifton Streets

- 2. Site of PUD for apartment house with ground floor retail known as View 14 on the east side of 14th Street between Florida Avenue and Belmont Street (90 feet, 6.0 FAR)
- 3. Further to the east, across 13th Street, Cardozo High School
- 4. Additional residential development

E. To the south:

- 1. Vacant land owned by the National Capital Revitalization Corporation (Parcel 34) on the west side of 14th Street between Florida Avenue and Belmont Street
- 2. Retail, service and other commercial and residential uses along 14^{th} Street
- 3. Site of PUD (under construction) apartment house with ground floor retail known as Union Row on the east side of 14th Street between V and W Streets (90 foot height, 4.73 FAR)
- 4. Reeves Center at 14th and U Streets

F. To the west:

- 1. Malcolm X (Meridian Hill) Park west of 15th Street
- 2. Additional residential development along the east-west streets
- VI. Zoning (see excerpt of Zoning Map, 2005, attached)
 - A. Existing zoning: C-2-B (no change proposed)
 - 1. General commercial district, permitting a broad range of retail, service and office uses, hotels, residential uses (single and multifamily) and many institutional uses
 - 2. Maximum height: 65 feet
 - 3. Maximum FAR: 3.5, of which no more than 1.5 may be for other than residential purposes
 - 4. Maximum percentage of lot occupancy: 80%

- 5. Side yards: not required
- 6. Minimum rear yard: 15 feet
- 7. Off-street parking:
 - a) For retail or service use: 1 space for each 750 square feet of gross floor area in excess of 3,000 square feet
 - b) For residential use: 1 space for each 3 dwelling units
- 8. PUD guidelines
 - a) Height: 90 feet
 - b) FAR: 6.0, of which no more than 2.0 may be for commercial uses
 - c) Yards and courts: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser
 - d) Parking and loading: as otherwise provided, subject to the Zoning Commission's discretion to approve greater or lesser

B. History

- 1. Zoned C-M-2 in 1958
- 2. Rezoned to C-2-B in 1992 as part of Uptown Arts Overlay District case
- C. Zoning of the area
 - 1. To the north: C-2-B along the 14th Street corridor
 - 2. To the east: R-5-B along the east-west streets
 - 3. To the south:
 - a) Arts/C-3-A along 14th Street
 - b) Arts/CR south of V Street

- 4. To the west: R-5-B along the east-west streets
- VII. Description of the proposed project
 - A. Apartment house with retail at the ground and lower levels
 - B. Height: maximum of 90 feet
 - C. Floor area ratio: 6.0 (239,946 square feet of gross floor area)
 - 1. 223,946 square feet of residential
 - 2. 16,000 square feet of retail
 - D. Parking:
 - 1. 158 spaces in underground garage for residential (minimum of 0.7 spaces per nit provided)
 - 2. 18 spaces on surface lot off the alley for the retail
 - E. Loading:
 - 1. 2 berths @ 30 feet
 - 2. 1 service/delivery loading space @ 20 feet
 - 3. All accessed off the alley
 - F. Comparison to matter-of-right and PUD standards for C-2-B
 - 1. Uses: residential and retail permitted as a matter-of-right
 - 2. Height:
 - a) Matter-of-right: 65 feet
 - b) PUD guideline: 90 feet
 - c) Proposed: 90 feet
 - 3. FAR:
 - a) Matter-of-right: 3.5

- b) PUD guideline: 6.0
- c) Proposed: 6.0
- 4. Proposed total gross floor area of 223,946 square feet is increase in total FAR of approximately 99,978 square feet
- 5. Proposed retail gross floor area of 16,000 square feet is approximately 44,000 square feet less than permitted as a matter-of-right and approximately 64,000 square feet less than permitted under PUD

VIII. Compliance with PUD evaluation standards of §2403

- A. Impact of project shall be favorable, capable of being mitigated or acceptable (§2403.3)
 - 1. Replacing strip shopping center with front facing surface parking with new residential and neighborhood serving retail uses
 - 2. Traffic will have no unacceptable impact on levels of service at build-out, per report by Wells & Associates
 - 3. Tax base implications for District are favorable, per report by Boland Smart
 - 4. Proposed height is acceptable and consistent with other approvals along the 14th Street corridor
- B. Project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan (§2403.4): see section IX, below
- C. Commission shall "judge, balance, and reconcile the relative value of project amenities and public benefits offered, the degree of development incentives requested and any potential adverse effects" (§2403.8)

D. Public benefits and project amenities

- 1. On-site benefits and amenities
 - a) New residential development of over 99,000 square feet more than the existing matter-of-right
 - b) Within residential density, approximately 15,000 square feet devoted to housing to persons making no more than 80% of the AMI
 - c) Neighborhood serving retail on two levels
 - d) 1,000 square feet of space reserved for lease at belowmarket rents to a public private partnership that will provided job and entrepreneurial training for community residents
 - e) Green roof and other sustainable design considerations
- 2. Community benefits:
 - a) Contributions to local community organizations totaling \$25,000
 - (1) Boys and Girls Club
 - (2) South Columbia Heights Neighborhood Association
 - (3) Samaritan Inns for the Service Enriched Housing Communities
 - b) Employment and training opportunities through First Source program

balanced against

- E. Development incentives:
 - 1. 25 foot increase in height over proposed matter-of-right
 - 2. Increase in total density of approximately 99,978 square feet, including decrease in commercial density of approximately 43,987 square feet

- F. Areas of flexibility from C-2-B or PUD standards:
 - 1. Reduction in residential recreation space (offset by private balconies and terraces)
 - a) Required: 33,591 square feet
 - b) Provided: 9,000 square feet
 - c) Requirement being repealed
 - 2. Roof structure setback:
 - a) Required 1:1
 - b) Provided: exceeds 1:1 except for a portion of the west side facing alley, where setback is as narrow as 2 feet but is more than 50 feet from the property line
 - 3. Lot occupancy (applicable to residential only)
 - a) Maximum allowed: 80%
 - b) Provided:
 - (1) 93% at ground floor (where there are only 4 residential units facing Chapin Street)
 - (2) 73% or less at all upper floors where most of the residential units are located
 - 4. Loading berth:
 - a) Required: 1 berth @ 55 feet
 - b) Provided: 2 berths @ 30 feet
 - c) 30 foot berth and service/delivery space combine to accommodate larger trucks

IX. Consistency with the Comprehensive Plan

A. The District Elements

- 1. The District of Columbia Comprehensive Plan Act of 1984 (D.C. Law 5-76, March 9, 1984)
- 2. The District of Columbia Comprehensive Plan Act of 1984 Land Use Element Amendment Act of 1984 (D.C. Law 5-187, February 15, 1985)
- 3. The Comprehensive Plan Amendments Act of 1989 (D.C. Law 8-129, January 5, 1990)
- 4. The Comprehensive Plan Amendments Act of 1994 (D.C. Law 10-193, October 19, 1994)
- 5. Comprehensive Plan Land Use Maps Approval Resolution of 1996 (Resolution 11-313, May 7, 1996)
- 6. The Comprehensive Plan Amendments Acts of 1998 (D.C. Law 12-275, April 27, 1999)
- 7. The Comprehensive Plan Amendment Act of 2006 (D.C. Act 16-637, signed December 28, 2006, pending NCPC review and Congressional layover)

B. Interpretation of the District elements

- 1. "The primary dynamic of the District elements of the Plan is the overlapping of its elements' goals. This overlapping is intentional." (§112.1)
- 2. "District elements of the Plan should be studied and executed in concert with each other and should be interpreted broadly." (§111.(a))
- 3. "The interpretation and implementation of any element should necessarily rely upon, and be respectful of, the objectives and policies of other elements." (§112.1(b))

- 4. "An element may be tempered, even defined, by one (1) or more of the other elements. This may occur within one (1) element and between elements. Since the Land Use element integrates the policies and objectives of all other District elements, it should be given greater weight than the other elements." (§112.1(c))
- 5. "The interpretation of the District elements of the Plan should also be guided by the major themes set forth in §101.1, which establish the overall priorities of the District elements of the Plan." (§112.2)

C. Major Themes

- 1. Stabilize and Improve the District's neighborhoods (§102)
- 2. Respect and improve the physical character of the District (§106)

D. Land Use element

- 1. Maps
 - a) Existing Generalized Land Use Map: medium density residential
 - b) Proposed Future Land Use Map: mixed use medium density residential and medium density commercial
 - c) Proposed Generalized Policy Map:
 - (1) Designated as part of a Main Street Mixed use Corridor
 - (2) Pedestrian oriented environment with traditional storefronts
 - (3) Upper story residential uses
 - (4) Support transit use and enhance the pedestrian environment

- 2. Objectives/Policies for Residential Neighborhoods (§1102)
 - a) "Conserve and enhance the essentially satisfactory qualities of the District's many stable residential neighborhoods" (§1102.1(a))
 - b) "Protect residential neighborhoods from disruptive uses" (§1102.1(e))
 - c) "Promote the conservation, enhancement and revitalization of the residential neighborhoods of the District for housing and neighborhood-related uses" (§1104.1(a))

E. Housing element

- 1. Major policies
 - a) Central theme to "stimulate a wider range of housing choices and strategies through the preservation of sound older stock and the production of new units" (§300.2)
 - b) Housing viewed as "key part of total urban living system that includes access to transportation and shopping centers, the availability of employment and training for suitable employment, neighborhood schools, libraries, recreational facilities, playgrounds, and other public amenities" (§300.4)
- 2. "Encourage the private sector to meet housing needs through the development of infill housing" (§302.2(f))
- 3. "Provide zoning incentives, as appropriate, to developers prepared to build low- and moderate-income housing, such as permitting additional densities in exchange for incorporating low- and moderate-income housing in development projects ... " (§303.2(d))
- 4. "Use Planned Unit Developments ... to encourage the construction or rehabilitation of additional single and multifamily housing at suitable locations" (§306.2(i))

- 5. "Promote the conservation, enhancement, and revitalization of the residential neighborhoods of the District for housing and neighborhood-related uses" (§1104.1(a))
- F. Environmental Protection element: policy to promote improvement of air quality by "promot[ing] land use patterns and transportation services which decrease reliance on automobiles for commuting and other routine trips" (§403.2(c))
- G. Transportation element:
 - 1. "Support land use arrangements that simplify and economize transportation services ..." (§502.2(a)).
 - 2. "Require major developments to demonstrate that adequate parking will exist for occupants and other users" (§505.2(e))

H. Urban design element:

- 1. "Preserve and enhance the outstanding physical qualities of District neighborhoods" (§702.1(b))
- 2. "Design residential, commercial, and all other buildings to complement or enhance the physical character of the District;" (§708.2(a))
- 3. "Design buildings to include the use of appropriate arrangements of building materials, height, scale, massing, and buffering to complement the immediate region." (§708.2(b))
- 4. Areas in Need of New and Improved Character (§712):
 - a) Objective to "encourage new development or renovation and rehabilitation of older structures in areas with vacant or underused land or buildings to secure a strong, positive physical identity" (§712.1)
 - b) "Encourage well designed development in areas that are vacant, underused or deteriorated. These developments should have strong physical identities." (§712.2(a))

- c) "Encourage in-fill development of attractive design quality in deteriorated areas to stabilize the physical fabric and to encourage renovation and redevelopment" (§712.2(b))
- d) "Establish a new physical identity in areas having a strong negative image ..." (§712.2(e))
- e) "Utilize large-scale development or capital improvement projects as opportunities for establishing a positive image or redirection in deteriorated areas" (§712.2(g))

I. Ward 1 element

1. Economic Development

- a) Goal to "Retain, expand, and attract new businesses and industries that are compatible with adjoining residential neighborhoods" (§1200.5)
- b) "Stimulate well-planned economic activity centers along major commercial corridors at the ... U Street-Cardozo metrorail stations, at appropriate underused commercially and industrially zoned sites" (§1202.1(a))
- c) "Encourage the development and retention of needed commercial and service establishments in appropriately zoned locations" (§1202.1(m))
- d) Implement economic development objectives for 14th and U Streets by "encouraging appropriate development on now vacant site and rehabilitation of the area's high quality older buildings" (§1203.1(u)(4))

2. Housing

a) "Stimulate production of new and rehabilitated housing to meet all levels of need and demand in Ward 1 and provide incentives for the full range of housing needed at desired locations throughout the ward" (§1205.1(a))

- b) "Encourage the private sector to provide new housing to meet the needs of present and future Ward 1 residents at locations consistent with the ward's land-use policies and objectives" (§1206.1(a))
- c) "Target residential development opportunity areas where significant housing development can appropriately occur and encourage multi-unit housing development, including market rate and low density housing, where appropriate, near the U Street and Shaw metrorail stations and at locations adjacent to proposed employment centers, including the 14th and U Street corridors" (§1206.1(d))
- d) "Establish, as a matter of major governmental priority, the production of housing for low- and moderate-income households in Ward 1" (§1206.1(e))
- 3. Transportation: "Support land use policies that simplify and economize transportation services in Ward 1, including mixed use zones that permit the co-development of residential and non-residential uses and encourage additional development at strategic locations, particularly near the U Street-Cardozo and Shaw-Howard metrorail stations" (§1214.1(a))

4. Urban Design

- a) "Design new residential, commercial, and other buildings to complement or enhance Ward 1's physical character" (§1222.1(b))
- b) "Include the use of appropriate arrangements of building materials, height, scale, massing, and buffering to complement the immediate areas" (§1222.1(c))

5. Land Use:

a) Major goal to be "the revitalization of the 14th and U Street corridors" (§1228.6)

b) Policy to "promote the establishment and growth of residential and mixed use commercial centers at appropriate locations to reduce automobile congestions, improve air quality, increase jobs, reduce reliance on the automobile and ensure neighborhood stability" (§1230.1(f))

X. Compatibility with the area

- A. Development follows precedent of higher density along radial corridors
- B. Design reflects location on a sloping site at edge of central area "bowl"
- C. Height steps down to the west
 - 1. Major portion of building is set back from west side lot line
 - 2. Along Belmont Street, high-rise portion of the building is set back 36 from the west property line
 - 3. Along Chapin Street, top two floors are set back approximately 25 feet from the west property line and 6 feet from the north facade

XI. Conclusions

- A. Project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan
- B. Project is within the applicable height and bulk standards of the Zoning Regulations
- C. Project provides an appropriate balance between the development proposed, the flexibility requested and the benefits and amenities provided
- D. PUD allows the Zoning Commission to condition approval to what is specifically proposed, without allowing more density or uncontrolled development
- E. Project should be approved



