

Pre-Hearing Statement
Julia Nanay (Opponent - Application No. 19044)

1. As the owner of 1510 Caroline Street NW, the property immediately to the west of the Applicant's property, I am most directly affected by the proposed addition to 1508 Caroline Street NW. I have concerns around the areas of relief sought, which I first outlined in my request for party status. Despite meeting once with the Applicant and his architect, no compromise has been reached, and I continue to have some serious concerns, as follows.

2. Request for Critical Root Zone Study I expressed my concern for the health and life of several trees on the boundary of my property with the owner Gerald West, his architect Michael Beidler of Trout Design, and ANC Commissioner Noah West at a joint meeting on 15 July 2015. I reiterated this concern and requested a critical root zone study to be conducted before any construction work begins, at both the ANC2B Zoning, Preservation and Development meeting on 2 September 2015, as well as at the ANC2B regular meeting on 9 September 2015. This request has not been reflected in either the applicant's statement, or the ANC's letter.
The architectural plans submitted show that a concrete retaining wall several feet in depth will be built on the western edge of the property, as well as a one storey side addition. Given the proposed concrete retaining wall's proximity to the existing trees (see photographs in Attachment 1), I have a valid concern that the trees will not only be damaged but may be killed by such construction. The presence of an arborist during construction may not be sufficient. I kindly request the Board of Zoning Adjustment to review the results of a critical root zone study, before further considering a request for special exception by the Applicant. Further, I would like the results of such a study to be shared with myself in a timely and transparent manner.

3. One Storey Side Addition A one storey side addition is proposed on the basis on an existing small shed on the side of 1508 Caroline Street NW. This shed was built prior to the enactment of the historic district, but more than fifty years after the original house was constructed. It is estimated that the side shed was built in the 1950s, whereas the main house was constructed in the 1870s. I note that the Office of Planning has determined that this small shed is part of the main residence and considers the property a row dwelling, but I would argue that this side shed is only a small covered entryway, constructed of wood and shingles (see photographs in Attachment 2). It should not be the basis for a wider and deeper brick extension that will extend further along the property boundary.
Further, at our joint meeting of 15 July 2015, ANC Commissioner Noah Smith stated his agreement that the side shed was not sufficient basis for a much larger side extension and

proposed a possible compromise which would eliminate the one storey side addition completely (including removing the existing side shed), while keeping the two storey addition in the rear. A compromise was ultimately not reached as I proposed also reducing the two storey rear addition to a one storey rear addition. This would be to match the depth and height of an existing one-story rear addition to the east of 1508 Caroline Street NW (that is, at 1506 Caroline Street NW, which is the primary residence of the Applicant, Gerald West).

I further note that the Office of Planning (OP) has asked the Applicant to explore lowering the height of the proposed one storey side addition so it does not extend beyond the first floor of the main building, as well as lessening its length, so the front wall remains in the location it is currently. The OP states that the Applicant agreed to lower the height of the one storey side addition by 12"-18". I welcome the OP's recommendations though I seek a much greater reduction in or elimination of the side addition. Also, I would like to clarify whether the OP's recommendations are reflected in the submitted architectural plans. Again, I ask that all changes or amendments to the plans be communicated to me in a timely and transparent manner, which unfortunately till this point, they have not been despite my requests.

4. Light and Air Quality I have detailed in my request for party status my concerns over how light and air will be affected at my property. Attached are photographs of my property to illustrate my concerns (see Attachment 3). In particular, please review the photograph taken from the interior of my house showing the alignment of an east window, and its close proximity to the existing side shed. Even at this time, with the small scale of the shed and in its state of disrepair, it is already blocking a significant amount of light. Even more light will be blocked if it were to be constructed of brick or other solid material, its roof height raised, and the structure extended further in length along the property boundary.

I am pleased to read that both the Office of Planning and ANC2B have noted the Applicant's agreement to provide a sun and shadow study. I requested a study at the ANC2B meeting on 2 September 2015, and reiterate that it should be a comprehensive sun and shadow study detailing different times of days, at different seasons of the year, providing analysis of the sun and shadow situation both if a) the existing trees remain intact; and b) if they are damaged or eliminated by the effects of the proposed project. I ask that the full study be shared with me in a timely and transparent manner, ahead of any construction related to the proposed project.

5. Letters from neighbors The Applicant has submitted letters of support from residents on Caroline Street NW. However, I would like to note that these households are not addressing the light and air concerns that I face as the immediate neighboring property. The other immediate neighboring property to the east of 1508 Caroline Street NW (1506

Caroline Street NW), is occupied by the Applicant Gerald West. It is therefore reasonable that the immediate neighbor to the East does not find issue with the effects of the project.

6. Transparency and Communication While the Board of Zoning Adjustment is primarily concerned with zoning regulations, I would like to state that throughout this process, I have not been directly consulted and no voluntary communication on plans or issues potentially affecting my property have been communicated to me. My tenants in the property have also been excluded from direct communication. From the tone of the letters submitted by neighbors, it appears that I have been portrayed as obstructionist, whereas I have been following the public discussion process available, since I was never voluntarily contacted by the Applicant.

Separately, I would like to express my concern that the Applicant's architect, Michael Beidler of Trout Design, sits on the ANC2B Zoning, Preservation and Development committee, and was present throughout its meeting on 2 September 2015, weighing in on its deliberation, despite having declared he would recuse himself from the discussion. His influence on the committee is clearly significant and impacts its recommendations.

ATTACHMENT 1



Photographs of Affected Trees

The two trees most likely to be affected. The tree between the two fences is on my property (1510 Caroline Street NW). The chain link fence is sitting on 1510 Caroline Street property; it was erroneously constructed more than 25 years ago. 1508 Caroline Street's property line is where the side of the small shingle shed extends to, illustrating the proximity of the proposed project to the neighboring property.

ATTACHMENT 1 - Continued
Photographs of Affected Trees



ATTACHMENT 1 - Continued
Photographs of Affected Trees



ATTACHMENT 2

Photographs of Existing Side Shed (1508) & Relation to 1510 Caroline Street NW



ATTACHMENT 2- Continued

Photographs of Existing Side Shed (1508) & Relation to 1510 Caroline Street NW



ATTACHMENT 2- Continued

Photographs of Existing Side Shed (1508) & Relation to 1510 Caroline Street NW



ATTACHMENT 3

Photographs of 1510 Caroline Street NW & Light and Air Concerns



ATTACHMENT 3 -Continued

Photographs of 1510 Caroline Street NW & Light and Air Concerns



ATTACHMENT 3 -Continued

Photographs of 1510 Caroline Street NW & Light and Air Concerns

