

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
November 29 and December 6, 2012

RECEIVED
D.C. OFFICE OF ZONING
2013 AUG 15 PM 1:41

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on November 29.

Present: Gretchen Pfahler, Acting Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Catherine Buell, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, and Joseph Taylor. **Not present:** Robert Sonderman.

NOVEMBER 29TH AGENDA

LANDMARK HEARINGS

Hamilton Hotel, 1001 14th Street, NW, Case #11-04.

The HPRB designated the Hamilton Hotel at 1001 14th Street, NW as a historic landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 7-0 [Davidson not present]

Spingarn High School, 2500 Benning Road, NE, Case #12-07.

The HPRB designated Spingarn Senior High School a historic landmark to be entered in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 7-0 [Davidson not present]

York Theater, 3641 Georgia Avenue, NW, Case #12-06.

The HPRB voted not to designate the York Theater a historic landmark to be entered in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 5-3 [Ally, Casarella, Metzger opposed].

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Engine Company No. 16, 1018 13th Street, NW, HPA #13-033, alteration/rehabilitation, widening of vehicle doors.

The HPRB recommended approval of a permit as sufficiently compatible with the character of the landmark. Vote: 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

901 D Street, NE (former Edmonds School), HPA #13-028, concept/renovation and new construction

The HPRB found the proposed subdivision, interior demolition, site plan, and general massing to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act (with conditions). The Board directed the applicant to return to the Board for ongoing design review when the plans have been further developed. Vote: 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

319 A Street, NE (rear), HPA #12-610, concept/replacement of two garages with new alley dwelling.

The HPRB found the proposed demolition, new construction, and subdivision to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 7-1 (Metzger opposed).

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Union Trust Company, 740 15th Street, NW, HPA #13-026, concept/alterations.

The HPRB found the proposed concept for signage, minor alterations to a window opening, awnings, and a raised platform above the existing areaway to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 7-1 [Davidson dissenting].

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1745-1755 N Street, NW, HPA #12-612, concept/rehabilitation, alteration, additions for residential use.

The HPRB voted to approve the staff recommendation, (A) reiterating its finding of 2010 that the extent of alteration to the historic buildings – including removal of the rear ell-wing on 1743, the roof of 1749, and interior demising walls – is consistent with the purposes of the act and would not constitute demolition requiring review by the Mayor's Agent; (B) finding the height, mass and footprint of the proposed rear addition to be sufficiently pulled away as to be respectful to the adjacent property to the east; (C) directed the applicants to continue studying the architectural character of the addition, with consideration given to materials, coloration, scale, and composition, in order to improve the compatibility of the addition with the subject properties and the Dupont Circle Historic District; (D) directed the applicants to continue working with staff to further develop the scope of exterior restoration, including recreation of the missing red tile roof on 1743 and, retention to the extent possible of significant interior finishes, such as fireplace mantles, wainscoting, and the distinctive Colonial Revival stair in 1745; and (E) Asked that the project return to the Board for further review when appropriate. Vote: 8-0.

1321 21st Street, NW, HPA #12-502, concept/three-story rear addition to existing three-story rowhouse.

The HPRB approved the concept for basement entry, roof alteration and rear addition, and delegated final approval to staff with conditions: (A) Revise rear addition elevations by reconsidering design vocabulary and/or materials to give it a lighter appearance; (B) coordination of mechanical units; (C) perform a flag test to demonstrate that the addition and roof alteration are not visible from the street. Vote: 6-2. [Casarella and Metzger opposed]

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1826 11th Street, NW, HPA #12-521, revised concept/new construction, three-story residential row building.

The HPRB approved the staff report with additional conditions: (A) Reconsider the location of the gas meters (B) Find the general revisions made to the façade to be improved but that the scale of uninterrupted window expanses be revised and the materiality of the cornice condition at the front elevation be addressed; (C) Encourage the architect to provide full documentation with annotated elevations, dimensions, and material choices for future submittals as was previously requested; (D) Re-position walkway to avoid single step up from sidewalk; (E) Delegate final approval to staff. Vote: 8-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The HPRB approved the following items on the consent calendar, 7-0:

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

1133 Park Street, NE, HPA #12-618, concept/two-story rear addition.

FOGGY BOTTOM HISTORIC DISTRICT

2526 I Street, NW, HPA #12-449, revised concept/rear addition.

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2009 Columbia Road NW, HPA #13-029, roof addition.

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

460-462 Ridge Street, NW, HPA #12-210, concept/new construction and addition.

SHAW AND BLAGDEN ALLEY HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1232 10th Street NW, HPA #13-024, concept renewal/two, 2-unit flats.

SHERIDAN KALORAMA HISTORIC DISTRICT

~~F. 2225 California Street, NW, HPA #11-472, revised concept/new construction~~ *[rescheduled for December 6th agenda]*

CONSENT DENIAL

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

~~G. 1315 T Street NW, HPA #13-021, concept/alteration, new basement entrance and alter iron stairs~~ *[deferred at request of applicant]*

DECEMBER 6TH AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on December 6, 2012.

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Acting Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger. **Absent:** Robert Sonderman and Joseph Taylor.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

~~McMillan Reservoir, revised master plan and design guidelines.~~ *[deferred at the request of the applicant]*

ST. ELIZABETHS' CAMPUS HISTORIC DISTRICT

1100 Alabama Avenue (2700 Martin Luther King Jr. Avenue), SE, HPA #13-032, concept/construction of pavilion.

The Board commented on the design presented. The members expressed concern for maintaining views across the front of the campus, from the public road to the principal historic buildings and vice versa. The Board also said that the green space into which the structure would be introduced is itself

significant and should not be completely remade by the new construction. Both issues are functions of the length and extent of the structure, as well as the degree to which the structure can be made more permeable to views or avoid altogether the most important views or axes especially from the center of the Maple Quadrangle). The Board expressed concern about materials and construction details and suggested that the structure is of a nature that looks permanent. Some members questioned the entire location in front of the 1902 buildings, suggesting that there are other locations that would better serve the neighborhood and avoid the adverse effects on the character of the campus, but on balance, most seemed comfortable with inserting a pavilion in the space proposed if it is reduced and/or reoriented and made more compatible. The members pointed out that the orientation of the building makes it more difficult to serve with food trucks and deliveries. The Board members recommended that the project return after further consideration of the appropriate location for the structure and with additional effort to make it more compatible with the campus's pattern. They requested more information on the materials and details; on the furniture; on what other elements the amphitheater might need to function; and on how the phasing of early development and the vehicular and pedestrian circulation might affect the layout of the pavilion and its site.

FOGGY BOTTOM HISTORIC DISTRICT

~~916 25th Street, NW, HPA #12-609, concept/rooftop addition and rear, basement addition.~~
[deferred at the request of the applicant]

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

~~14-2200-2202 14th Street NW, HPA #13-022, concept/six-story new construction and rear addition to two-story house~~ [deferred at request of the applicant]

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Equitable Cooperative Building Association, 915 F Street, NW, HPA #13-027, concept/rear 5-story addition.

The HPRB found the massing concept for a five-story rear addition on top of the existing two-story rear wing to be compatible for the landmark and its context within the Downtown Historic District and directed the applicant to continue developing the design for the elevation of the addition and return to the Board when appropriate. Vote: 6-0

SHERIDAN KALORAMA HISTORIC DISTRICT

2225 California Street, NW, HPA #11-472, revised concept/new construction.

The HPRB approved the revised concept and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 4-0 [Casarella and Davidson recused]

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>