

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
July 25 and August 1, 2013

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on July 25 and August 1, 2013.

JULY 25 HPRB AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on July 25, 2013.

Present: Gretchen Pfahler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Joseph Taylor. Absent: Charles Wilson.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION HEARING

Park View Playground and Fieldhouse, 693 Otis Place NW, Case #13-18.

- The Board designated the property a historic landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that it be forwarded for listing in the National Register. Vote: 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Rosedale, 3501 Newark Street, HPA #13-466, concept/new construction, single family house.

- The Board approved the concept as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act with consideration of HPRB and staff report comments. Vote: 8-0.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3520 30th Street, NW, HPA #13-315, concept/window opening alterations and rear addition.

- The Board approved the project in concept and delegated final approval to staff, with the condition that an onsite mockup of the proposed synthetic slate product be made available for staff and community review and approval prior to submission of the permit application and construction documents. Vote: 8-0.

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

7112 Chestnut Street NW, HPA #13-471, concept/new construction of single family home.

- The Board approved the proposed concept as compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 8-0.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1736 Irving Street NW, HPA #13-456, concept/roof addition.

- The Board supported the concept of a roof addition, as long as it is not visible from Irving Street, but encouraged the applicant to: select a material other than Hardipanel for the rear elevation (or trim it out with battens to create more texture); set back those elements of the addition that project beyond its rear wall; be careful about any changes to the chimneys that would be visible from the street; carefully work out the roof drainage; minimize the visual weight of the deck

railing; refrain from placing electric meters in front or an air-conditioning unit on the addition roof; and reduce the thickness and slope of the addition roof to reduce its height. Further review was delegated to the staff. Vote: 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

208 5th Street, SE, HPA #13-386, concept/rear addition.

- The Board found the project consistent with the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff with the condition the applicant modify the proposed design of the addition's roof so that it does not exceed the height of the historic building; determine an appropriate location for mechanical units and utility meters; refine the windows on the rear elevation; address roof drainage and avoid drainage into the side court. Vote: 8-0.

1016 7th Street, SE, HPA #13-402, concept/rear addition.

- The Board did not find the proposal to be compatible with the original building and the historic district. The Board directed the applicant to refine the design so that the addition is not visible from the public street and return to the Board with an updated proposal. Vote: 8-0.

535 6th Street, SE, HPA #13-454, concept/rear addition.

- The Board found the concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. The demolition of the garage was excluded from the proposal and the applicant was directed to return to the Board with additional information on the garage if the applicant wishes to proceed with demolition. The applicant was advised to replicate the original door surround if its historic configuration could be determined. Final approval was delegated to staff with the following conditions: the roof deck should be pulled from the edge of the house to mitigate its visibility; an alternative to pressure-treated wood be identified for the deck railing; the rear dormer be pulled down to spring just below the ridge; and the addition's siding be distinguished from the original building. The applicant was advised to work with staff on the location of mechanical units, vents, and utility meters; the selection of appropriate windows and door for the front elevation; and the color and material for the roof. Vote: 5-3 (Pfaehler, Metzger and Sonderman opposed).

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2012-2014 Kalorama Road NW, HPA#13-348, rear addition and renovation.

- The Board approved the addition and delegated permit approval to staff, adopting the recommendations in the staff report and with further direction to install a fence on the side yard property line, consider a contrast in color for the addition windows and brick, and to allow other permit reviews to occur prior to HPO approval. Vote: 6-2 (Casarella and Davidson opposed).

AUGUST 1 HPRB AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on August 1, 2013.
Present: Gretchen Pfahler, Chair; Andrew Aurbach, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger and Charles Wilson. Absent: Rauzia Ally, Maria Casarella, Robert Sonderman and Joseph Taylor.

BLAGDEN ALLEY AND SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1211 10th Street NW, HPA #13-476, permit/substantial demolition.

- The Board deferred taking action to allow the applicant to discuss legal issues they raised at the meeting with HPO and OAG regarding the Board's jurisdiction over the proposed demolition. Vote: 5-0.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1412 T Street NW, HPA #13-169, concept/new rowhouse construction.

- The Board found the proposed concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district with the condition that a flag test should be done to ensure that the third floor not be visible from any vantage point on T Street, and the rear third floor wall should be set back 4-6 feet from the existing rear walls of houses in this row. The Board delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 3-2 (Metzger and Davidson opposed).

16TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

905 16th Street, NW, HPA#13-324, concept for new construction/addition.

- The Board supported the staff report and: (A) Find the latest design proposal for windows/doors at the Hod Carrier's Building with the minor adjustments recommended above compatible with the historic building; (B) Recommend that the architect work with HPO staff to minimize the visibility of the railings through materials and reflectivity, (C) Find the connector segment and the new penthouse on the addition to be compatible; and (D) Find the basic massing, materials, and design direction of the new building compatible, and ask the architect to return to HPRB as the elevations are developed and the street level is addressed. Vote: 5-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

20 14th Street, NE, HPA #13-156, concept/raze and construct parking pad.

- The Board found the proposed concept to be incompatible with the historic district and denied the applicant's request to raze the garage. Vote: 3-2 (Aurbach and Davidson opposed). The Board determined the garage to be a contributing building to the Capitol Hill Historic District. Vote: 3-2 (Aurbach and Davidson opposed).

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on July 25:

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

McCormick Apartments, 1785 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, HPA #13-323, revised concept/alterations for penthouse addition, exterior stair and landscape.

- The Board approved the project with the conditions that the applicant continue working with HPO to simplify the gate on P Street, keep working on simplifying penthouse and minimize the paving in the front. Vote: 7-0 (Davidson recused)

All Souls Church, 1500 Harvard Street, NW, HPA #13-462, concept/alteration, repair, accessibility improvements and landscape modifications.

BLAGDEN ALLEY AND SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1320 9th Street NW, HPA #13-395, concept/two-story rear addition to commercial building.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

500 8th Street, SE, HPA #13-268, concept/storefront alterations.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3038 Rodman Street, NW, HPA #13-480, concept/ rear addition.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1617-1619 19th Street, NW, HPA #13-469, concept/new construction of carriage house at rear.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1861 Newton Street NW, HPA #13-415, concept/two-story rear addition.

1751 Park Road NW, HPA #13-460, concept/third-floor addition.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2241 12th Place NW, HPA #13-474, concept/roof addition.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Property Address:	905 16th Street, NW	X	Agenda
Landmark/District:	16th Street HD		Consent Calendar
Meeting Date:	July 25, 2013	X	Concept Review
H.P.A. Number:	13-324		Alteration
Staff Reviewer:	Kim Elliott / David Maloney	X	New Construction

Gensler Architects on behalf of Laborers International Union of North America (LiUNA) seeks conceptual design review for new construction of a 9 story building plus penthouse on Eye Street as an addition to the Hod Carrier's Building, a contributing building in the 16th Street Historic District.

Property Description

Currently, the site is a vacant lot facing south on Eye Street, previously occupied by the Lucerne Apartments built in 1899 and demolished between 1937 and 1963. The new construction will be an addition to the LiUNA building that sits at the northeast corner of 16th and Eye Streets and was designed by prominent architects Eggers and Higgins, the protégés of and successors to John Russell Pope. It was completed in 1959.

Proposal

The Board reviewed this project in May 2013, which focused on alterations to the Hod Carrier's Building, massing of the new building/addition, and massing of the penthouse connection piece between both buildings; the present proposal focuses on the design of the new construction. Three façade variations for the addition have been proposed, variations of a steel and glass skin building with stone as an infill building on the previous vacant space between the Hod Carrier's Building and 1575 I Street. Although the maximum building height for this lot is 130', the proposed design is approximately 110' with an 18' tall penthouse. The building will be internally and programmatically connected to the Hod Carrier's Building.

The drawings also include modifications to the alterations to the Hod Carrier's Building responding to the Board's and HPO's previous comments.

Evaluation

The massing of the new construction fits in contextually—it is shorter than its neighbor to the east, topping out at 110' (128' with the penthouse), with a lower section similar in height to the historic building penthouse. All three façade options include a curtain wall projecting bay that begins at level three and then vary in height and width. Option C is the most successful with a more elongated, off-center projection. The tall, off-center bay is advantageous because it sets up more pleasing proportions to the overall building mass and offers a more comfortable space between the projection and the Hod Carrier's Building. The elevation has started to take shape – with shifting planes of stone and glazing, however the transitions at the top and bottom of the projecting bay could become more composed as the design is developed.

Although the main entrance to the building will be at the 16th Street and I Street entries of the Hod Carrier's Building, the projecting bay on the addition establishes a hierarchy and sense of importance to this new façade. The design would benefit from further study of the ground level articulation with either a more monumental entry to the ground level retail space centered on the bay, addition of a canopy, or other architectural features that activates this elevation/entry.

In addition, there is an opportunity to make a reference to the Hod Carrier's Building while still maintaining a very different style and material palette. The juxtaposition of a modern building to the historic limestone building is certainly not inappropriate given the varied nature of downtown. However given that the program and interior space treat the entire space as one building, there is a disconnect between the facades. Perhaps there is an opportunity to reference the Hod Carrier's Building – a color, or coursing, or other detail, while still maintaining its own distinct modern design.

The penthouse on the addition is shifted to the west to avoid conflict with the existing west facing windows at 1575 Eye Street. The simple stone-clad form is responsive to the HPRB comments calling for a clean backdrop and a simple geometric massing at the penthouse level.

Also in response to the Board's comments from the May 2013 meeting, the connector piece between the existing building and new construction at the penthouse levels has been minimized so that the original square stepped-in masses of the Hod Carrier penthouse are legible.

The latest proposal for the penthouse openings at the Hod Carrier's Building addresses the concerns of maintaining the overall mass of the penthouse – keeping the windows in the same plane as the stone, and maintaining a masonry pier between the window openings. If not already aligned, HPO recommends centering each penthouse window/door over the 8th floor windows – giving a little more width to the masonry piers between windows/doors.

In addition, due to the prominent corner that the Hod Carrier Building occupies, there are strong sightlines to the terrace that need to be addressed. Moving the railing and any other roof accessories back an additional foot or two from each side would help remedy the visibility issue.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board

- *Find the latest design proposal for windows/doors at the Hod Carrier's Building with the minor adjustments recommended above compatible with the historic building;*
- *Require the terrace railings be moved back an additional 12-24" on each side to help with sightline issues, and delegate final approval to staff on the above two items.*
- *Find the connector segment and the new penthouse on the addition to be compatible;*
- *Find the basic massing, materials, and design direction of the new building compatible, and ask the architect to return to HPRB as the elevations are developed and the street level is addressed.*