

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
July 25 and August 1, 2013

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on July 25 and August 1, 2013.

JULY 25 HPRB AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on July 25, 2013.

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Joseph Taylor. Absent: Charles Wilson.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION HEARING

Park View Playground and Fieldhouse, 693 Otis Place NW, Case #13-18.

- The Board designated the property a historic landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that it be forwarded for listing in the National Register. Vote: 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Rosedale, 3501 Newark Street, HPA #13-466, concept/new construction, single family house.

- The Board approved the concept as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act with consideration of HPRB and staff report comments. Vote: 8-0.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3520 30th Street, NW, HPA #13-315, concept/window opening alterations and rear addition.

- The Board approved the project in concept and delegated final approval to staff, with the condition that an onsite mockup of the proposed synthetic slate product be made available for staff and community review and approval prior to submission of the permit application and construction documents. Vote: 8-0.

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

7112 Chestnut Street NW, HPA #13-471, concept/new construction of single family home.

- The Board approved the proposed concept as compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 8-0.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1736 Irving Street NW, HPA #13-456, concept/roof addition.

- The Board supported the concept of a roof addition, as long as it is not visible from Irving Street, but encouraged the applicant to: select a material other than Hardipanel for the rear elevation (or trim it out with battens to create more texture); set back those elements of the addition that project beyond its rear wall; be careful about any changes to the chimneys that would be visible from the street; carefully work out the roof drainage; minimize the visual weight of the deck

railing; refrain from placing electric meters in front or an air-conditioning unit on the addition roof; and reduce the thickness and slope of the addition roof to reduce its height. Further review was delegated to the staff. Vote: 8-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

208 5th Street, SE, HPA #13-386, concept/rear addition.

- The Board found the project consistent with the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff with the condition the applicant modify the proposed design of the addition's roof so that it does not exceed the height of the historic building; determine an appropriate location for mechanical units and utility meters; refine the windows on the rear elevation; address roof drainage and avoid drainage into the side court. Vote: 8-0.

1016 7th Street, SE, HPA #13-402, concept/rear addition.

- The Board did not find the proposal to be compatible with the original building and the historic district. The Board directed the applicant to refine the design so that the addition is not visible from the public street and return to the Board with an updated proposal. Vote: 8-0.

535 6th Street, SE, HPA #13-454, concept/rear addition.

- The Board found the concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. The demolition of the garage was excluded from the proposal and the applicant was directed to return to the Board with additional information on the garage if the applicant wishes to proceed with demolition. The applicant was advised to replicate the original door surround if its historic configuration could be determined. Final approval was delegated to staff with the following conditions: the roof deck should be pulled from the edge of the house to mitigate its visibility; an alternative to pressure-treated wood be identified for the deck railing; the rear dormer be pulled down to spring just below the ridge; and the addition's siding be distinguished from the original building. The applicant was advised to work with staff on the location of mechanical units, vents, and utility meters; the selection of appropriate windows and door for the front elevation; and the color and material for the roof. Vote: 5-3 (Pfaehler, Metzger and Sonderman opposed).

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2012-2014 Kalorama Road NW, HPA#13-348, rear addition and renovation.

- The Board approved the addition and delegated permit approval to staff, adopting the recommendations in the staff report and with further direction to install a fence on the side yard property line, consider a contrast in color for the addition windows and brick, and to allow other permit reviews to occur prior to HPO approval. Vote: 6-2 (Casarella and Davidson opposed).

AUGUST 1 HPRB AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on August 1, 2013.
Present: Gretchen Pfahler, Chair; Andrew Aurbach, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger and Charles Wilson. Absent: Rauzia Ally, Maria Casarella, Robert Sonderman and Joseph Taylor.

BLAGDEN ALLEY AND SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1211 10th Street NW, HPA #13-476, permit/substantial demolition.

- The Board deferred taking action to allow the applicant to discuss legal issues they raised at the meeting with HPO and OAG regarding the Board's jurisdiction over the proposed demolition. Vote: 5-0.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1412 T Street NW, HPA #13-169, concept/new rowhouse construction.

- The Board found the proposed concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district with the condition that a flag test should be done to ensure that the third floor not be visible from any vantage point on T Street, and the rear third floor wall should be set back 4-6 feet from the existing rear walls of houses in this row. The Board delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 3-2 (Metzger and Davidson opposed).

16TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

905 16th Street, NW, HPA#13-324, concept for new construction/addition.

- The Board supported the staff report and: (A) Find the latest design proposal for windows/doors at the Hod Carrier's Building with the minor adjustments recommended above compatible with the historic building; (B) Recommend that the architect work with HPO staff to minimize the visibility of the railings through materials and reflectivity, (C) Find the connector segment and the new penthouse on the addition to be compatible; and (D) Find the basic massing, materials, and design direction of the new building compatible, and ask the architect to return to HPRB as the elevations are developed and the street level is addressed. Vote: 5-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

20 14th Street, NE, HPA #13-156, concept/raze and construct parking pad.

- The Board found the proposed concept to be incompatible with the historic district and denied the applicant's request to raze the garage. Vote: 3-2 (Aurbach and Davidson opposed). The Board determined the garage to be a contributing building to the Capitol Hill Historic District. Vote: 3-2 (Aurbach and Davidson opposed).

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on July 25:

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

McCormick Apartments, 1785 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, HPA #13-323, revised concept/alterations for penthouse addition, exterior stair and landscape.

- The Board approved the project with the conditions that the applicant continue working with HPO to simplify the gate on P Street, keep working on simplifying penthouse and minimize the paving in the front. Vote: 7-0 (Davidson recused)

All Souls Church, 1500 Harvard Street, NW, HPA #13-462, concept/alteration, repair, accessibility improvements and landscape modifications.

BLAGDEN ALLEY AND SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1320 9th Street NW, HPA #13-395, concept/two-story rear addition to commercial building.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

500 8th Street, SE, HPA #13-268, concept/storefront alterations.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3038 Rodman Street, NW, HPA #13-480, concept/ rear addition.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1617-1619 19th Street, NW, HPA #13-469, concept/new construction of carriage house at rear.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1861 Newton Street NW, HPA #13-415, concept/two-story rear addition.

1751 Park Road NW, HPA #13-460, concept/third-floor addition.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2241 12th Place NW, HPA #13-474, concept/roof addition.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Property Address:	1785 Massachusetts Avenue, NW	Agenda
Landmark/District:	McCormick Apartments	X Consent Calendar
		X Concept Review
Meeting Date:	July 25, 2013	X Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	13-323	New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Steve Callcott	Demolition
		Subdivision

Hartman-Cox Architects, representing the American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research (AEI), seeks on-going conceptual design review for a penthouse addition and exterior and interior alterations to the McCormick Apartments. The building is a contributing structure to the Massachusetts Avenue and Dupont Circle Historic Districts, a landmark on the DC Inventory of Historic Sites, and listed as a National Historic Landmark.

When reviewed in May, the Board found the proposed concept for an infill addition within the private alley, a new entrance on P Street and a penthouse to be compatible with the building. The Board asked that the detailing of the penthouse dormers be simplified and for the new stair and entrance to be further developed, ensuring that it did not connect to the building in a way that caused permanent damage, and for further information on the metal mesh to be installed on the areaway railings.

Revised Proposal

The plans more specifically illustrate the detailing of the proposed penthouse dormers, which have been developed as greatly simplified versions of the dormers on the primary roof. The stair has been redesigned with a metal pan and stringers that will support stone treads and risers, rather than as a solid stone stair. The structure of the stair would be self-supporting, abutting but not connecting to the building; the only alteration to the elevation would be the lowering of the window sill to allow for conversion to a door, as previously shown. The metal mesh around the areaways would consist of 1/8" diameter wire spaced 2" on center; photographs of a sample installed in place have been submitted to provide a more accurate rendering of its visual impact.

The landscape plan has also been further developed. The hardscaping alterations would include replacing the existing concrete curbs around the perimeter of the property, reconstructing the driveway to its original dimensions using granite paving, slightly decreasing the planting area in the front to improve pedestrian access from the corner to the front door, and creating a small paved seating area in the public space on Massachusetts Avenue. A small free-standing monument sign within the planted area is proposed but has not yet been designed. A planting plan has also been developed that retains and/or replaces foundation plantings that screen the below-grade areaways.

Evaluation

The proposed refinements to the concept are compatible and consistent with the character of the property. The simplified detailing of the dormers will ensure that they are secondary and distinguishable from the originals on the floor below, while still having a consistency of form

and line. The revised stair design is lighter in visual weight and its installation is entirely reversible without causing alteration to the building. The proposed metal mesh along the areaway railings is sufficiently thin and lightweight as to not become a prominent visual element. The landscape plan retains an appropriate green setting for the property, with compatible replacement paving materials, while also providing needed improvement for pedestrian access.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the revised concept compatible with the building and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegate final approval to staff